The Role of Chinese Ethnic Media in Response to Mainstream Media’s Portrayals of Chinese Diaspora in New Zealand

By

Yu Yao (Olivia)

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of

Master of International Communication

Unitec Institute of Technology
Auckland, New Zealand
2015
DECLARATION

Name of candidate: Yu Yao (Olivia)

This Thesis/Dissertation/Research Project entitled "The Role of Chinese Ethnic Media in Response to Mainstream Media's Portrayals of Chinese Diaspora in New Zealand" is submitted in partial fulfilment for the requirements for the Unitec degree of Master of International Communication

CANDIDATE’S DECLARATION

I confirm that:

- This Thesis/Dissertation/Research Project represents my own work;

- Research for this work has been conducted in accordance with the Unitec Research Ethics Committee Policy and Procedures, and has fulfilled any requirements set for this project by the Unitec Research Ethics Committee.

  Research Ethics Committee Approval Number: 2014-1088

Candidate Signature: ......................................................... Date: ......................

Student number: 1414194
Abstract

Ethnic media is said to perform a number of roles, including: 1) protecting and (re) constructing ethnic culture and identity, 2) providing knowledge and information to newcomers and 3) giving an independent space which allows ethnic communities to represent themselves in their own words. In New Zealand, the number of Chinese migrants has steadily increased since the introduction of the 1987 Immigration Act, but the portrayal of the Chinese diaspora in its dominant media has often been invisible and negative. This is difficult for Chinese people to tolerate because they are afraid to ‘lose face’, which is an important part of traditional Chinese social ethics and refers to the fear of public shame. Along with other Chinese cultural characteristics of collectivism, members of the Chinese diaspora may consider that bad descriptions would bind them together and affect other people’s impression about their community. Under the circumstance, Chinese ethnic media may play an important role in assuaging people’s feelings and counteracting the negative influences within the Chinese community.

This study employed two qualitative research methods, content analysis and semi-structured interviews, to probe the way in which one Chinese ethnic online media, SkyKiwi.com, responded to the representation of the Chinese people in the New Zealand Herald [the Herald]. The research is based on two case studies. The first case involves Auckland Mayor Len Brown’s affair with Bevan Chuang in 2013. The second case is based on the reporting on an incident during which a group identified by the Herald as Chinese tourists ate at a charity Christmas lunch in 2012.

A comparison of reports about these events in both media outlets, indicates a tendency of the Herald to focus on more dramatic descriptions of celebrities and to be more connected with the dominant, Pākehā group. The findings showed SkyKiwi.com
emphasises vicarious experience, which is the involvement of the audience to engage in a news story by highlighting the emotional elements, in its news reports and the way it used online sources.

Two strategies, including the selection of information for pre-determined goals and the audience-oriented description, can be identified in these comparisons. These strategies explain the important role SkyKiwi.com played in response to the portrayals of Chinese people in the *Herald*, including guiding the audience to understand both events from another angle and providing an independent, alternative media space in which the Chinese diaspora in New Zealand could represent themselves in their own words.
To Yajie Li, my loving friend in heaven
Acknowledgements

The dissertation would not have existed in this form without the people who supported me and encouraged me.

Firstly, I would like to express my gratitudes to my supervisors, Dr. Elena Kolesova and Dr. Philip Cass for the significant comments, remarks and engagement throughout this master thesis. They always patiently assisted me and encouraged me. Without their help and advices, I would not be at this stage and this dissertation would not be even exist.

Secondly, many thanks to Catherine Mitchell, lecturer in Te Puna Ako Learning Centre (TPA). She helped me much in thesis writing and always encouraged me to go on.

Thirdly, many thanks to SkyKiwi journalists Hao Peng, Xiaoyu Zou and the Herald reporter Lincoln Tan, who kindly participated in my research interview and provided a lot of invaluable insights.

Finally, my thanks go to my husband, Nan Liu. He gave me his unconditional support, love and understanding throughout all my master study.
# Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction ............................................................................................................. 1  
1.1 Rationale .......................................................................................................................... 1  
1.2 Aims and objectives .......................................................................................................... 4  
1.3 Operational definitions ..................................................................................................... 5  
1.3.1 Mainstream Media ...................................................................................................... 5  
1.3.2 Ethnic media .............................................................................................................. 6  
1.3.3 Media representation ................................................................................................. 7  
1.3.4 Chinese diaspora ...................................................................................................... 7  
1.3 Thesis structure ................................................................................................................. 8  

Chapter 2: The background of the two cases ......................................................................... 9  
Case one: The Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in 2013 .................................................. 9  
Case two: Chinese tourists dining at the Christmas charity lunch in 2012 .............................. 10  

Chapter 3: Literature review .................................................................................................. 12  
3.1 The role of ethnic media ................................................................................................. 12  
3.2 Mainstream Media’s negative portrayals of ethnic communities: Reasons and consequences ...... 19  

Chapter 4: Methodology ......................................................................................................... 24  
4-1 Research methods ............................................................................................................ 24  
4.1.1 Content analysis ........................................................................................................ 26  
4.1.2 Semi-structured interview ....................................................................................... 27  
4.2 Data analysis .................................................................................................................. 27  
4.3 Ethical considerations ...................................................................................................... 28  

Chapter 5 Findings .................................................................................................................. 30  
Case one: The Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in 2013 .................................................. 31  
   The New Zealand Herald .................................................................................................. 31  
   SkyKiwi.com .................................................................................................................... 36  
Case two: Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch in 2012 .............................................. 46  
   The New Zealand Herald .................................................................................................. 46  
   SkyKiwi.com .................................................................................................................... 49  

Chapter 6: Analysis and Discussion ........................................................................................ 56  
6-1 Case one: The Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in 2013 ......................................... 57  
6-2 Case two: The Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch in 2012 ............................... 63  
6-3 The comparison between the news reports on SkyKiwi.com ....................................... 68
List of tables

Timeline A : Chuang and Brown Affair news in the mainstream and ethnic media ..........................31
Timeline B : Chinese visitors news in the mainstream and ethnic media ........................................31
Table 1-1. The representation of Chuang extracted from the Herald ...........................................32
Table 1-2. The representation of the affair extracted from the Herald ..........................................34
Table 1-3. The representation of Brown extracted from the Herald .............................................35
Table 2-1. The representation of Chuang extracted from SkyKiwi.com .......................................37
Table 2-2. The representation of Chuang extracted from the SkyKiwi.com .....................................38
Table 2-3. The representation of the affair extracted from SkyKiwi.com .......................................41
Table 2-4. Chuang’s nine statements extracted from SkyKiwi.com ..............................................43
Table 2-5. The representation of Brown extracted from SkyKiwi.com .........................................44
Table 3-1. The representation of the Chinese extracted from the Herald ......................................46
Table 3-2. The mainstream society reactions extracted from the Herald .................................48
Table 4-1. Six contentious points extracted from SkyKiwi.com ..................................................50
Table 4-2. Alternative explanations extracted from SkyKiwi.com ................................................53
Table 4-3. People’s reactions extracted from SkyKiwi.com .....................................................54

List of abbreviations

MSM Mainstream media; English-language media in New Zealand
The Herald/ NZH The New Zealand Herald
SkyKiwi SkyKiwi.Com
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Rationale

With more and more Chinese people deciding to leave their homeland and settle in New Zealand, it is important for them to learn how the mainstream media [MSM] represents them in their adopted country. Chinese people generally have difficulties with tolerating negative comments and descriptions about them, especially in non-Chinese language media as they are afraid to ‘lose face’. The idea of ‘losing face’ refers to a fear of public shame when their social performance has fallen below acceptable levels (Ho, 1976). It is also “an important part of traditional Chinese social ethics” (Lin, 2007, p. 46). Along with other cultural characteristics of collectivism, which assumes that “groups bind and mutually obligate individuals” (Oyserman, Coon, & Kemmelmeier, 2002, p. 5), members of various Chinese diaspora may consider that bad news and unflattering descriptions would bind them together and affect other people’s impression of their community.

After the introduction of the 1987 Immigration Act\(^1\) in New Zealand, selection of immigrants based on race and national origin was replaced by criteria which concentrated on skills and personal merit (Ip & Leckie, 2011). The 1987 Act led to a massive influx of Chinese students, investors and professional migrants to New Zealand.

---

Zealand (Manning, 2013). Unfortunately, depictions of Chinese migrants in the New Zealand MSM are often negative or simply invisible. As an example, Chinese women are often depicted as untrustworthy and Chinese men as less masculine. According to Cui (2011) and Wallis (2012), the negative media coverage and biased portrayals may unsettle Chinese people about their identities and contribute to a lack of their sense of belonging. It may also affect the “social cohesion and harmony” in their new country (Cui, p. 137). Under these circumstances, the role of Chinese ethnic media in response to the representations of the Chinese diaspora in the New Zealand MSM is vitally important as it provides a form of counselling to the Chinese diaspora and counteracts undesirable influences upon the Chinese community. Although not all members of the New Zealand Chinese diaspora can read the Herald or English-language media, many of them will still be informed by others in the diaspora about MSM’s portrayal of them and negative news stories may lead to a heated debate within the Chinese community.

This research analyses the ways in which one example of Chinese ethnic online news media, SkyKiwi.com, has presented different angles from the MSM about two particular stories of Chinese people within the New Zealand community. The first case is the Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in 2013. This story was about a Hong Kong-Chinese woman, Bevan Chuang, who was intimately involved with Auckland mayor, Len Brown, which led to a loss of public confidence in his role as mayor. The second case involved a group of Chinese people dining at a charity Christmas lunch in 2012.
There was debate, between MSM and Chinese ethnic media, about whether the group of people were tourists or Chinese New Zealanders.

Ethnic online news media, with its characteristics of being low-cost and convenient for users to access (Aitchison & Lewis, 2003; Matsaganis, Katz, & Ball-Rokeach, 2010), plays an increasing role and has become more important than traditional media sources in contemporary societies. Lewis (2003) asserts that online news media enable migrants to access some information not available from traditional media, such as newspapers and MSM. This means that the audience can better interpret particular events or incidents. Lewis claims that online news media can provide “a theme-based group of news objects held together graphically, overlapping with other such groups and undergoing progressive updating” (p. 97). This technique blurs the boundaries between stories and links to a wider field of content. It also enables users to blend articles with photographs, audio and video reports unavailable on traditional static media (Aitchison & Lewis).

According to Niche Media, a communication agency that provides marketing analysis and solutions for multicultural media in New Zealand (Niche Media, 2013), Chinese ethnic media in New Zealand comprises three Chinese ethnic TV channels, three radio stations, four online media sites, two magazines and nine newspapers. Among them, Skykiwi.com (天維網 written in traditional Chinese; 天维网 written in simplified Chinese), is the most-visited website by Chinese people in New Zealand. It
reaches nearly 80% of those of Chinese ethnicity and has about 75,000 visits every
day (SkyKiwi., n.d; EMINZ). According to these statistics, listening to what Skykiwi.com
is saying has already become an important part of the Chinese community’s daily life
in New Zealand. This makes SkyKiwi.com the significant Chinese ethnic media outlet
worthy of further investigation.

News reports on SkyKiwi.com about the two chosen cases will be compared
with those in the *New Zealand Herald*. The *Herald*, according to ABC statistics, is
Auckland’s daily newspaper with the largest circulation among all newspapers in New
Zealand. Due to the fact that both cases discussed in this research took place in
Auckland, it is appropriate to choose the *Herald* as a key MSM source in this study.

1.2 Aims and objectives

The aim of this study is to explore the role of Chinese ethnic media in
responding to the portrayals of Chinese people in the *Herald*. By comparing the news
reports on SkyKiwi.com and in the *Herald*, this research will contribute to improved
understanding of the role of Chinese ethnic media and illustrate the news values
presented by SkyKiwi.com. It will provide an insight into how such media can shape
public opinion within the New Zealand Chinese communities. This study will also
provide a basis and direction for further research on Chinese ethnic media in New
Zealand.
Chapter One

The research was conducted based on the following central research question:

- What was the role of the Chinese ethnic online news media (as represented by SkyKiwi.com) in response to the representation of Chinese diaspora in the MSM of New Zealand?

To answer this main question, there are a set of sub-questions:

1. How were the images of Bevan Chuang shaped by the *New Zealand Herald* and SkyKiwi.com respectively? What are the differences and similarities between them?
2. How were the portrayals of Chinese visitors shaped by the *New Zealand Herald* and SkyKiwi.com respectively? What are the differences and similarities between them?
3. How did SkyKiwi.com tell the stories of Bevan Chuang and the Chinese visitors?

1.3 Operational definitions

1-3-1 Mainstream Media

Mainstream media [MSM] are media, such as newspapers and broadcasters, transmitted via the largest distribution channels in a country, which generally reflect the dominant thought, influences, values and perspectives (Chomsky, 1997). The majority of MSM are commercialised or government-owned (Khamis, 2011). MSM can also be described as ‘traditional media’ and ‘old media’ in contrast with ‘alternative media’ and ‘new media’ (Moulitsas, 2007; Tkacheva, Schwartz, Libicki, Taylor, &
Martini, 2013). MSM in New Zealand are English-language media dominated by Fairfax New Zealand, New Zealand Media and Entertainment (NZME), MediaWorks New Zealand and Sky TV (Rosenberg, 2008). The Herald is owned by New Zealand Media and Entertainment (NZME).

1-3-2 Ethnic media

Ethnic media, also referred to as minority media, immigrant media and community media (Matsaganis et al., 2010), is a genre of media produced by members of a particular ethnic community for themselves. It can be structurally analysed in terms of eight elements, suggested by Browne (2005), including types of outlets, levels of services, policy, financing, operational goals, media service-minority community links, primary audience and programming. Matsaganis et al., (p. 6) have noted other characteristics of ethnic media. These include the use of languages by ethnic media and the size of the organisations. Other characteristics described by Matsaganis et al., overlap with Browne’s genres of target audiences, contents, and sponsors. Any combinations of these characteristics can help create a picture of an ethnic media and also can be used to analyse and interpret its roles and functions (Matsaganis et al., 2010).
1-3-3 Media representation

Stuart Hall (1997a) in a video-lecture introduces that media representation is the act of portraying an existing meaning in such a manner as to influence public opinion and action. Media representation is a way in which meaning is given to images and words, which stand for referents. It is also a way of portraying particular group(s) or community(-ies) and ideas from a particular ideological or values perspective. Rather than reflecting a single ‘reality’, media representations can serve to ‘re-present’ a reality or even create a new reality (Hall; Ministry of Education in New Zealand, 2006).

1-3-4 Chinese diaspora

The term ‘Chinese diaspora’ refers to a cohort of Chinese people, both Han and non-Han, who have been dispersed from their ancestral homelands and have settled in different countries (Barabantseva, 2011; Ember, Ember, & Skoggard, 2005). Li (2013) believes that the Chinese diaspora only means immigrants and their descendants from the Greater China Region including mainland China, Hong Kong, Macau, and Taiwan. On the other hand, scholars such as Liao (2007) claim that people from other countries, such as Malaysia and Singapore, may also be considered as part of the Chinese diaspora. If this was the case, then the term ‘Chinese diaspora’ could be used interchangeably with ‘oversea Huaren’, which means ‘overseas Chinese’ (海外華人 written in traditional Chinese; 海外华人 written in simplified) (Lin,

1.3 Thesis structure

Chapter One of this thesis provides an overview of this research, indicating the research questions, the aims and the important operational definitions. Chapter Two introduces the background of the two cases, the Brown and Chuang affair in 2013 and the Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch in 2012. Chapter Three analyses the literature in the field of ethnic media. Chapter Four explains the methodology used in this project. Research procedures and data analysis are also introduced in this chapter. Chapter Five presents the findings and Chapter Six demonstrates data analysis and discussion. Chapter Seven concludes this study and points out some further research directions.
Chapter 2: The background of the two cases

Case one: The Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in 2013

Len Brown was the Mayor of Auckland and the head of the Auckland Council in New Zealand at the time of the discussed incident (McMillan, 2013; Slater, 2013). He won the Auckland Mayoral election in 2010 and was reappointed in 2013, although he was affected by the scandal associated with his extra-marital affair before his re-election.

The Chinese woman involved in this scandal was Bevan Chuang, a Hong Kong-born Chinese New Zealander. She was a member of the Auckland Council’s Ethnic Peoples Advisory Panel in 2011 and failed to gain a seat in the Albert-Eden Local Board of the Auckland Council in 2013 (“Auckland Council,” 2011; Daly, 2013; Lu, 2013; “NZ Herald,” 2012). Bevan Chuang also had a criminal record after illegally accessing the private emails of a former director of Auckland Museum in 2008, and was fined $1000 to be paid to the museum (Maas, 2013).

Brown publicly admitted the two-year extra-marital affair with Ms Chuang. He also apologised for causing his family “shame and humiliation” (“Stuff.co.nz,” 2013).
On the other hand, Chuang claimed that she had been used and pressured by another mayoral candidate, John Palino, and by the Whale Oil blogging team. Whale Oil is a right-wing blog used to attack the political opponents of the National Party. It is owned by Cameron Slater, whose father was the campaign manager of the Palino election team (3News/NZH, 2013; Hager, 2014; Orsman, 2014; Savage, Orsman, & Tan, 2013).

The Whale Oil blog posted the first story about the affair, along with Chuang's affidavit, on its webpage at 2pm on October 15, 2013. The information presented in this blog was picked up by several national MSM outlets such as Television New Zealand [TVNZ], Stuff News, RadioLIVE and the Herald. These news reports provided new private details of the affair, such as Brown and Chuang having sex in the mayoral office and the Auckland Town Hall. The Whale Oil blog claimed these details were provided by Chuang ("Stuff.co.nz," 2013). On October 17, SkyKiwi.com published its first news report on the scandal with the headline, “Bevan Chuang claims she was manipulated”. SkyKiwi.com published news stories about the Brown and Chuang affair from October 15th, 2013 until April 3rd, 2014. The Herald published stories about it from October 16th, 2013 to March 23rd, 2014.

Case two: Chinese tourists dining at the Christmas charity lunch in 2012

On Christmas day, 2012, TVNZ Channel One reported that “a smattering of Chinese tourists on an organised tour had arrived at the Auckland City Mission
Chapter Two

Christmas charity lunch” (“ONE News.co.nz,”); this story was immediately picked up by other New Zealand MSM. According to the news reports in the Herald, this group of about 10 Chinese tourists arrived in December 2012 for a four-day tour of the North Island and decided to extend their visit to experience a Western country’s Christmas (Tan, 2013). They were described as being led by a Chinese guide to the charity lunch.

This incident provoked an angry public reaction in some parts of New Zealand mainstream society. However, within the Chinese community, different viewpoints about the incident emerged and were reported by SkyKiwi.com. Some Chinese believed the report was the result of a misunderstanding, while others thought the MSM had represented Chinese people in this way to shame the Chinese community. The SkyKiwi news reports included analyses of the incident and people’s responses.

The Herald carried a number of reports, including one headed “City Mission to Tourists: Pay Up”, between December 27th, 2012 and January 5th, 2013. SkyKiwi.com published several news reports between December 26th, 2012 and February, 2013. Headlines included “Did the mainstream media misunderstand? Chinese tourists dining at the Charity lunch might be Rashomon\(^2\) incident” and, “What was the truth? An investigative report on the Chinese tour group dining in the Charity Christmas meal”.

\(^2\) The Rashomon effect refers to the contradictory interpretations of the same event by different people based on a famous novel of Akutagawa Ryunosuke, ‘Rashomon 廣步門’ as well as an equally famous film by Akira Kurosawa.
Chapter 3: Literature review

There is limited literature on the role of ethnic media in response to negative representation in MSM, especially relating to Chinese ethnic online media in New Zealand. However, some important research on the role of ethnic media, as well as on the reasons and consequences of MSM’s negative depiction of ethnic communities, may need to be discussed.

3.1 The role of ethnic media

Ethnic media is said to perform a number of roles, including: 1) protecting and (re) constructing ethnic culture and identity; 2) providing knowledge and information to newcomers so they can be better integrated into the mainstream culture in the adopted nation and 3) giving an independent space to ethnic communities to allow their self-representation in their own words (Browne, 2005; Georgiou, 2005; Kaldor-Robinson, 2002; Matsaganis et al., 2010; Ojo, 2006; Shiramizu, 2000; Viswanath & Arora, 2000). In terms of theories, Benedict Anderson’s ‘imagined communities’ (1983) and Jürgen Habermas’ (1989) public sphere have been used by scholars such as Georgiou (2006), Shi (2005) and Sun, Yue, Sinclair & Gao, (2011) in their research on the role of ethnic
media. Imagined communities are not actual communities, but rather a group of people who feel a sense of connection and similarity with one another (Anderson, 1983). Based on the concept of imagined communities, Arjun Appadurai (1996) developed the concept of ‘imagined worlds’ by creating five scapes including ethnoscapes, mediascapes, technoscapes, financescapes as well as ideoscapes (p. 37). Just as technoscapes bring about new types of cultural interactions through the power of technology, ethnoscapes generate a new reality through a transnational and intercultural diffusion of ethnic communities within the global society (ibid). Ethnoscapes emphasises a globalised spatial distribution of ethnic groups by means of migration of social agents such as immigrants, visitors, and guest workers (Appadurai, 1996; Hogan, 2010; Schetter, 2005). In other words, as Maronitis (2007) says, “Socio-cultural relations have stopped being objectively transmitted and perceived, and they largely depend on the historical, linguistic and political situation of a diverse assembly of actors” (p. 2). Shi (2005) describes ethnic media as “diaspora public spheres”, which provide desired information regarding ethnic communities and raise questions about the treatment of “outside societies”.

Kaldor-Robinson (2002) and Shiramizu (2000) identify the role of traditional and new ethnic media as connecting ethnic communities with their homelands and (re) constructing their national identity. It is worth noting that the flow of information in ethnic media is two-way, which means that information and news articles can be produced in both the homelands and overseas and be transmitted back and forth.
Such two-way communication can be seen in terms of Shiramizu’s concept of small and big media. He asserts that small media are normally produced in the homelands, serving overseas individuals’ need for daily information about their own country and about their compatriot’s communities within the adopted countries. Big media, on the other hand, are a type of political media and is generally produced abroad by domestic diasporic activists and students. These media products normally need to be smuggled back to their homelands (ibid). Most information from big media is about issues recognised as serious in their home countries. Examples include Chinese newspapers in Japan, which published discussions about the Tiananmen Square incident in 1989. However, big media can sometimes suspend publication once the issues about its homeland are resolved and as a result they cannot be published in the homeland. Big ethnic media seem to confound Galtung’s Centre-periphery model (Galtung & Ruge, 1965; Thussu, 2000), in which the global news flow is from the centre to the periphery via transnational news agencies. In other words, the centre’s definition of news would be reflected in the news of the periphery (Thussu, 2000). If the centre can be understood in this case as the homeland and the periphery as the diaspora, the dissemination of information in big media demonstrates a transition in the flow of information, which is no longer from the centre to the periphery, but from many peripheries to the centre.

The role of ethnic media in promoting the integration of newcomers in a host country has been considered by scholars such as Georgiou (2005), Ojo (2006) and
Matsaganis et al., (2010). Viswanath and Arora (2000) claim that an ethnic community’s success in a new country depends, to a great extent, on newcomers’ integration and assimilation into their new society, as well as on how the adopted country perceives and receives them. General information such as rules, points of culture, and symbols of assimilation into the new country provided by ethnic media are significant for new arrivals (Georgiou; Matsaganis et al.; Viswanath & Arora).

Another significant role of ethnic media is to provide an independent voice and space for ‘voiceless’ ethnic communities (Li, 2013; Matsaganis et al., 2010). Ethnic media, as an alternative media, can provide an opportunity for members of a given ethnicity to represent themselves in their own words, reflect ethnically specific interests and ideologies and construct positive images in mainstream society and among themselves (González Aldea, 2012; Browne, 2005; Georgiou, 2005; Li; Matsaganis et al.; Ojo, 2006). Viswanath and Arora (2000) point out that ethnic newspapers in the United States give communities a boost by representing ethnic groups in a positive light. Ethnic media also act as a sentinel, warning readers of external threats and changes by, for example, presenting stories about crime against immigrants and changes to immigration laws. González Aldea notes that, in Spain, Romanian ethnic media journalists act as spokespersons for their community. However, it is worth noticing that, if ethnic media only uses ethnic languages, the effectiveness of these representations in the mainstream society will be limited.
Like any other ethnic media, Chinese ethnic media performs the roles provided above, such as assisting newcomers’ integration into their adopted country by providing knowledge and rules about local cultures and promoting connections between overseas Chinese and their homelands (Li, 2013; Shi, 2009; Zhou & Cai, 2002). Chinese ethnic media in particular minimise internal diversity (Chan, 2006; Han, 2009; Sun et al., 2011), which is a result of what Li calls “multilayered Chinese identity” (p. 27). Internal diversity is a phenomenon within Chinese communities around the world. In essence, Chinese identity is complex and determined by the multiculturalism of Chinese societies. The concept of being Chinese can be defined as belonging to either one of two groups, Han Chinese and non-Han Chinese people (Barabantseva, 2011). The term non-Han Chinese refers to those who belong to the officially recognised 55 ethnic minorities in the People’s Republic of China (Wang, 2011), such as Uyghurs or Tibetans. These people normally have their own languages, cultures and religions which are different to the Han majority (Barabantseva). The term Han Chinese, derived from the Han Dynasty\(^3\), refers to people who come from an ethnic group of certain parts of East Asia including Mainland China, Hong Kong, Macau, Taiwan, Singapore and Malaysia (Lin, 2007; Wen et al., 2004). However, it is important to note that people who belong to the Han Chinese also identify themselves differently. For example, people in Mainland China use only the word ‘Chinese’ to identify themselves; on the other hand, their counterparts in Malaysia generally identify themselves as Malaysian or Malaysian Chinese. This could be explained by political

---

\(^3\) Han Dynasty (漢朝): (206 BC - 220 BC) was the second imperial dynasty of China (206 BC - 220 BC).
division caused by geographical differences (as in the case with Malaysia), or by historical reasons as in the case with Taiwan and Hong Kong, which was a British Crown colony until 1997 (Huang, Liu & Chang, 2004; Li). Nonetheless, another notion, that of ‘cultural commonality’, has been raised which explains that Han Chinese have a common root (Li) and share common ancestry and culture. This notion seems to be easily accepted by all Han Chinese. Huang et al., also suggest that “the identities associated with culture can be either superordinate or subordinate to national identity” (p. 150). In this regard, some new words such as ‘Chinese-ness’, ‘Chinese overseas’, ‘Huaren’ (華人), ‘overseas Huaren’ (海外華人) and ‘Hanren’ (漢人) (Lin; Wang, 1991) have been produced and come into use in Chinese ethnic media across the globe to describe Han Chinese, and are accepted by all Chinese communities worldwide according to Shi (2005).

This can be exemplified by a study on Phoenix Satellite Television, a Hong Kong-based transnational Chinese ethnic television (Han, 2009 cited in Liu, 2001). Phoenix redefines ‘Chinese’ more broadly as ‘Huaren’ (華人) or the ‘Hua people’ (華) (Chan, 2006; Han, 2009; Sun et al., 2011), but also identifies ‘country’ as ‘home’ or ‘family’ (Han). This, to a great extent, blurs political and geographic boundaries and is likely to be accepted by the Chinese people in different regions and countries around the world (Shi, 2005; Chan; Sun et al.).

In New Zealand, specific research on Chinese ethnic media seems to be quite
scarce, although some general research has been done. Lin (2007) and Li (2013) have identified its role in providing knowledge about New Zealand’s culture and rules to new arrivals and offering an independent space where the Chinese community can discuss such issues, for example, the use of false documents for Chinese international students’ visa applications in 2012. However, it is important to note that, rather than blurring the boundaries and constructing a collective identity, the space provided by Chinese ethnic media in New Zealand is more likely to emphasise the distinction between the identities of Chinese from different countries. This was similar to Li’s assertion that it is difficult for Chinese ethnic media and the Chinese community in New Zealand to develop a homogeneous set of ideas about their identity and can be exemplified by the incident of *iBall* newspaper’s reporting Chinese international students’ prostitution in Auckland in 2006, discussed by Lin (2007). Faced with complaints from the Chinese community that *iBall*, as the only Chinese ethnic media publishing in English language, should not report such sensitive stories, Lincoln Tan⁵, the reporter and owner of *iBall*, responded in his column in the *Herald* that he never identified himself as a Chinese (Lin). This response led to more widespread outrage. Quoting his description, the *New Zealand Chinese Herald* questioned Lincoln Tan’s knowledge and eligibility to report news about the Chinese community because, the paper believed that, as a Singapore born Chinese, Tan was not ‘true Chinese’, which the *New Zealand Chinese Herald* recognised as those who are born in mainland China.

---


⁵ Lincoln Tan is the New Zealand Herald’s diversity, ethnic affairs and immigration senior reporter. He began his journalism career in 1990 in Singapore but moved to New Zealand in 1997. He first started writing for the *Herald* as a columnist in 2005 but switched to reporting full time for this paper in 2007. He previously worked as an editor for *iBall*, an ethnic community newspaper.
Chapter Three

(Lin). The *Chinese Herald* raised the point of the complicated self-identities within the Chinese community as well.

There are many roles of ethnic media already identified by the earlier research in different countries. Chinese ethnic media share some of them, but also play a specific role in minimising internal diversity while at the same time constructing a collective identity. However, according to Li (2013), the Chinese ethnic media in New Zealand are unable to achieve the goal of constructing the collective identity of Chinese diaspora in New Zealand and replacing the multilayered Chinese identity.

3.2 Mainstream Media’s negative portrayals of ethnic communities: Reasons and consequences

In MSM, negative portrayals of ethnic communities are not accidental, but a pervading phenomenon experienced by ethnic communities in multicultural societies (Bullock & Jafri, 2000; Wallis, 2012) due to the fact that the majority of the MSM are sponsored and owned by a country’s elite institutions or government (Khamis, 2011; Wallis). Though there is limited research on it, this issue is going to be a matter of increasing concern because of the trend towards immigration across the globe. To help understand such negative representation among MSM, Hall’s (1997b) theory of representation, which refers to the way a society is constructed through the respective
inclusion and exclusion of certain types of images in the media, has been used frequently by researchers. In discussing how the Chinese community is depicted by MSM in New Zealand, it is necessary to acknowledge the reasons for and the consequences of such negative depictions of ethnic communities in the MSM.

In the New Zealand context, there is already some research about the stereotyping of Chinese communities in the MSM. According to Wallis (2012), Chinese women are regularly portrayed as being connected with extra-marital affairs and depicted as untrustworthy, self-obsessed, blunt or as third-world peasants on New Zealand television. In addition, Chinese men are generally conveyed as cowardly, emaciated, weak and less masculine than Western men. The coverage of the Chinese ethnic community in the New Zealand MSM is often categorised within such themes as immigration debates, ideas of the ‘outsiders’ and immigrants being potentially dangerous (Baker & Benson, 2008). On the other hand, the contribution of the Chinese diaspora to New Zealand, their personal achievements and the discrimination they experience in the country occurs less in the MSM (Cottle, 2000). Therefore, the negative images of the Chinese community, such as the images of corruption and violent crimes, could already have become familiar stereotypes for the consumers of the MSM who are predominantly Pākehā6 (Baker & Benson; Cottle; Wallis). Certainly, there are some positive images of the Chinese community in the New Zealand MSM too, but as Cottle claims, in general, they seem to be superficially covered along with

---

6 Pākehā: A Māori language term for New Zealanders of European descent. In this project it shares a similar definition to ‘white dominant group’, ‘whiteness’ and ‘white people’ in New Zealand society.
cultural festivals and ethnic exoticism of the community.

The MSM’s negative portrayal of ethnic groups has several reasons, described by scholars Ojo (2006), Henry (1999), and Miller (1998). The primary reason is systemic inequality, reflected in what could be termed ‘news racism’, in an immigrant nation where whiteness is a privilege (Wallis, 2012). As Van Dijk (1993, cited in Spoonley, 2008) and Winter (1997, cited in Ojo, 2006) assert, news media is a key agent, legitimising an undemocratic system and racism in order to maintain white hegemony in some immigrant countries, such as Canada, Australia and New Zealand. Van Dijk (1993) said:

“...the media play a central role in the reproduction of racism both because of their relationship to other elite institutions and because of their structural influence in shaping and changing the social mind…” (as cited in Spoonley, 2008, p. 4)

The dominant media in the immigrant countries have become more aware of the multicultural social reality, however, they still prevent the full participation of ethnic communities in dominant society (Spoonley, 2008; Wallis, 2012).

Due to the fact that most of New Zealand’s MSM is commercially owned (Rosenberg, 2008), maximising profit and market share can be considered as the second reason why such media often portray ethnic groups negatively. The media of New Zealand, in a predominantly white society, may have easily excluded ethnic communities and depicted them negatively on the grounds that mainstream audiences have more market share and money for media products (Baffoe, 2012; Ojo, 2006).
Baker and Benson (2008) observe that MSM has reduced political coverage and switched to reporting "celebrities, human interest and crime stories" (p.185). Comrie (1996, as cited in Baker & Benson) has found that the function of media is changing from providing information to providing vicarious experience, which can draw in audiences to emotionally participate in news stories. Under these circumstances, along with the prevailing strategy in the MSM of “positive self-representation” and “negative other-presentation” (Cottle, 2000, p.38), its journalists and reporters, to some extent, seem to be encouraged to pursue dramatically negative representation of ethnic stories in their news.

The lack of ethnic diversity in MSM newsrooms may be another important reason for the negative framing of ethnic communities (Ojo, 2006; Baffoe, 2012; Cottle, 2000). As Ojo points out, some dominant cultural ideologies and prejudices are more likely to appear in news productions if most journalists and reporters in the outlets are white. There are only a few Asian reporters working in the mainstream New Zealand English-language media (Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade, 2007). Although the numbers may be increasing, the ethnic communities seem to still have less power to oppose the stereotypical representation or misrepresentation of themselves in the MSM reports.

Some scholars such as Cui (2011) believe that the negative portrayals of ethnic communities in the MSM may have undesirable effects on both mainstream society
and ethnic communities. For members of ethnic communities, these negative representations may unsettle their identity and self-esteem and challenge their sense of belonging in the adopted country (Bullock & Jafri, 2000; Tortajada & Willem, 2009). Spoonley (2008) asserts that the negative representation of ethnic immigration in the dominant media seem to “encourage a panic similar to that accompanying natural catastrophes” (p. 5) within the ethnic communities. For mainstream society, the negative representation or biased stereotypes of ethnic people may harm social cohesion and social harmony as well as negatively influence upon democratic development (Cui).

In short, systemic inequality, the commercialised media environment and the lack of ethnic diversity in MSM newsrooms may be the reasons why ethnic communities have been constantly depicted negatively. These unflattening representations could lead to negative effects in both mainstream societies and ethnic communities.
Chapter 4: Methodology

In this chapter, the research design is presented as follows: firstly, the choice of research methods and data collection are outlined; secondly, data analysis is demonstrated and thirdly, the ethical considerations for doing this research are discussed.

4-1 Research methods

This research, based on the comparative case studies approach, uses a qualitative methodology with semi-structured interviews and qualitative content analysis methods to investigate how SkyKiwi.com responded to the Herald’s portrayals of Chinese in its stories about the Brown and Chuang affair and the Chinese tourists at the charity lunch. Reinard (1998) emphasises that qualitative methods in communication research often help the researcher to interpret the meaning of communication exchanges in social reality. In other words, it can make the world visible through a set of techniques within a particular context (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000; O’Leary, 2010). Bryman (2012), Babbie (1985), Madrigal and McClain (2012) assert that qualitative research is more flexible than quantitative, allowing the researcher to respond to data on participants as it emerges during the investigation. However, contextual limitations may be a weaknesses of qualitative research (Madrigal &
Before detailing the data collections of this research study, it is important to clarify the difference between two forms of news publications - news reports and news columns. News reports are expected to transmit a body of factual information addressing the five ‘w’s and one ‘h’ of investigative journalism, (who, what, when, where, why and how) with the aim of conveying the truth as much as possible (Hart, 1996; Li, 2005). This objective should leave no questions remaining (Meyer, 1995). News reports cannot include authors’ viewpoints and opinions, but introduce and report other people’s opinions based on facts (Li). On the other hand, news columns, written by columnists, generally include the authors’ opinions and subjective comments on an issue or event, aiming to shape and guide the perception of the public (Gans, 1979; Li). Regarding the Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair, only news reports were collected from both media outlets (the Herald and SkyKiwi.com). In terms of the Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch, on the other hand, news commentary as well as reports in the Herald were collected. This is due to the fact that its counterpart, SkyKiwi.com, lacked the basic news elements (Hart; Li) and did not fully conform to the criteria of news; instead, it quoted many unnamed speakers and unverified sources in its media products. Thus, the Herald’s data included both types of news (reports and commentaries), aiming to balance the descriptions about the news occurrence in both media sources.
4.1.1 Content analysis

Content analysis is a versatile tool for qualitative and quantitative research (Elo & Kyngäs, 2008; Reinard, 1998). In this research, qualitative content analysis is employed to collect and analyse data. According to Vogt (2005), content analysis is “one of several research techniques used to describe and systematically analyse the content of written, spoken or pictorial communication” (p. 59). It can be used to “interpret individual cases in an intensive manner” (Reinard, 1998, p. 302). The Herald and SkyKwi.com articles about Len Brown’s affair and the Chinese tourists were categorised with primary coding according to the date of publication, writer, content type, headline and inclusion of pictures or quotes. For the Brown and Chuang affair, each news article was allocated a unique code, such as Chuang – E01 (CE01) and Chuang- C01 (CC01), in line with the published dates. The letter ‘E’ followed by a number refers to English news reports in the Herald; the letter ‘C’ means Chinese news reports on SkyKiwi.com. In the case of the Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch, the codes were given chronologically, for example, Visitors in Charity – E01 (VE01), Visitors in Charity – C01 (VC01). As outlined above, the letters ‘E’ and ‘C’ followed by a number indicate which language was used. These codes were applied throughout the research process to avoid any confusion or inconsistency (Reinard).

The aim of this research was to examine the role of Chinese ethnic media in response to the representation of the Chinese diaspora in MSM, which meant focussing on the
portrayals of Chinese people. To this end, the search terms, ‘Chinese lover - Chuang’ and ‘Chinese tourists’ were the key elements guiding the choice of the news from both media outlets about the respective cases.

4.1.2 Semi-structured interview

Like other types of interview, a semi-structured interview underlines verbal exchange (Gillham, 2000; Ritchie, Lewis, Nicholls, & Ormston, 2013) and the establishment of mutual trust between interviewers and interviewees. Unlike the structured interview, though, semi-structured interviews are very flexible and fluid (Mason, 2004). This research used open-ended questions, which are said to suit semi-structured interviews (Louise Barriball & While, 1994) to explore interviewees’ broader and unexpected perspectives on the issues of this study. The interviews were conducted with three journalists - two Chinese journalists from SkyKiwi.com and one reporter from the Herald - in addition to the main data of this research (the news reports and news columns from both media outlets). Interviews were fully taped and transcribed and notes were made as the interview progressed.

4.2 Data analysis

Based on the comparative case studies approach, aside from identifying the differences between the Herald and the SkyKiwi.com news reports, I also conducted
a cross-case comparison to determine whether SkyKiwi.com used the same strategies for each case to respond to the MSM’s portrayals. O’Leary’s (2010) reflective analysis with thematically inductive technique was employed to assess the data gathered by the semi-structured interview. After the primary coding of the news reports from both media sources (such as publication date and headline), more detailed data was grouped into main categories, generic categories and sub-categories (McCain, 1988). This is illustrated below using an example based on the SkyKiwi.com data:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Categories</th>
<th>Generic Categories</th>
<th>Sub-categories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chuang</td>
<td>Little Princess</td>
<td>Suffering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Abandoned</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No-sense of safety</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3 Ethical considerations

This research was conducted in accordance with guidelines set by the Unitec Research Ethics Committee [UREC] for maximum protection of the participants and the researcher. To avoid misunderstanding and misconduct due to language issues, the consent forms and information sheets for this study were provided in English and traditional Chinese (繁體字) in order to meet the different language needs of the Chinese and English speaking interviewees. All the data collected will be stored and
treated confidentially at Unitec Institute of Technology Mount Albert Campus for 10 years. The only people who will have access to the data will be the project supervisors and the researcher. All the data collected from the Chinese media and through the semi-structured interviews with Chinese journalists was translated into English and verified by two qualified linguists in order to guarantee the quality of the use of the Chinese content in this study.
Chapter 5 Findings

This chapter presents the findings about the Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in 2013 and the Chinese visitors dining at the Christmas charity lunch in 2012. For this project, 10 news items and 14 news stories were collected about the affair from SkyKiwi.com and the *New Zealand Herald* [the *Herald*] respectively, published from October 16th, 2013 to April 3rd, 2014 (see Timeline A). Five news stories from SkyKiwi.com and three items from the *Herald* between December 26th, 2012 and February 21st, 2013 were collected about the Christmas charity lunch (see Timeline B). As well as these news articles, some significant items such as news pictures were also collected. Doris A. Graber (1996) claims that “combining pictures with words makes the message more memorable” (p. 87). Because some pictures were used by both sources with different news reports, it is pertinent to identify how SkyKiwi.com used the same pictures to shape images of Chinese people and public opinion in a manner distinct from that of the *Herald.*
Timeline A: Chuang and Brown Affair news in the mainstream and ethnic media
(Reference to the codes Appendix 1 & 2)

Timeline B: Chinese visitors news in the mainstream and ethnic media
(Reference to the codes Appendix 3 & 4)

Case one: The Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in 2013

The New Zealand Herald

In the Herald, 13 news pictures accompanied 14 news reports that were about the Brown and Chuang affair. The main sources of the quotes within these articles were the Whale Oil blog and Radio Live (see Appendix 1). The news stories mainly
focused on the description of the affair, portrayals of Chuang, and the relationship between Chuang and Brown, Luigi Wewege and John Palino’s election team. Palino, a rival to Brown in the 2013 Auckland mayoral election, was accused by Chuang of pressuring and using her to make the relationship with Brown go public. Wewege, a member of the Palino team, was said by the *Herald* as another sexual partner of Chuang.

*Table 1-1. The representation of Chuang extracted from the Herald*

| Bevan Chuang |
|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| **Chuang’s Image** | **Chuang’s Relationship with Luigi Wewege** | **Chuang’s Reputation** | **Chuang’s Criminal Past** |
| Brown’s former lover (CE13) (CE14) | Former mistress (CE07)(CE08) (CE09)(CE10) (CE11) (CE12) | Compared her with Monica Lewinsky (CE01) | Another sexual partner (CE06) |
| Burlesque dancer (CE09) | Right-wing politician (CE01) | | Intimate relationship (CE08) |
| At the centre of/ behind the sex scandal (CE01) (CE05) | Had a long-running affair with Auckland Mayor Len Brown (CE01) (CE05) | | Non-boyfriend (CE08) |
| Unsuccessful candidate (CE01) | Flirty (CE09) | | |
| Had relationships with Brown and his rival campaign worker Luigi Wewege (CE09) | | | |
| **Chuang’s Impression of Len Brown** | **Chuang’s Criminal Past** | | |
| Not attractive (CE01) | Powerful (CE01) | Trying to not disclose (CE07) | Clear of (CE07) |
| Intoxicating influence (CE01) | | | |

(Please reference the codes the Appendix 1)

Most of the portrayals of Chuang’s image were negative. Phrases like ‘Brown’s ex-lover’, ‘former mistress’, ‘Brown’s former lover’, ‘burlesque dancer’ and the word ‘flirty’ were used in the news items to describe Chuang, who was ‘at the centre of /
behind the sex scandal’ and ‘had a long-running affair with Auckland Mayor Len Brown’ (see Table 1-1). ‘Noriety’ and ‘compared herself with Monica Lewinsky’ (see Table 1-1) were used to describe Chuang’s reputation. Political phrases like ‘right-wing politician’ and ‘unsuccessful candidate’ were also employed to describe her. With the words ‘another sexual partner’, ‘intimate relationship’, and ‘non-boyfriend’, Chuang’s relationship with Luigi Wewege was often mentioned as the news reported her affair with Len Brown. Moreover, Chuang’s impression of Brown was reported as her finding him ‘not attractive’ but ‘powerful’ and an ‘intoxicating influence’ (see Table 1-1). This implies that, to some extent, Chuang was ‘Brown’s lover’ because of his power rather than his personality and physical appeal. Despite its lack of direct relevance to the affair, Chuang’s criminal past was noted and included in the news stories about her and Brown. The phrases ‘trying to not disclose’ and ‘clear of’ (see Table 1-1) were employed to describe her attitude and behaviour towards her criminal record.

A total of 12 photos of Chuang and one other Chinese committee person were taken from the Herald (see Appendix 5-1). Among the photos of Chuang, six photos show her wearing dark sweaters without a facial expression. Three show her with a crooked smile; these were the ones accompanied by the articles, ‘Revealed: Chuang’s computer criminal past’, ‘Chuang cleared of criminality’ and ‘Television: Tele tell-all lacks emotion from Mayor’s mistress’ (see CE02, CE07, CE09, Appendix 5-1). These were expected to indicate Chuang’s guilt and regret about her criminal behaviour and her involvement in Brown’s marriage. Another three photos show Chuang wearing light
grey with a big smile and were used to report that ‘Chuang pays price for affair’, ‘Chuang: Len Brown is still my role model’, and ‘Chuang denied 2\textsuperscript{nd} term’ (CE10, CE11, CE14, Appendix 5-1).

Table 1-2. The representation of the affair extracted from the Herald

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Affair</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description of the affair</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extra-marital affair (CE08) (CE03)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex scandal (CE05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chuang’s viewpoints towards the affair</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complicated (CE01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual attraction (CE01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No romantic relationship (CE01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Call for Len Brown’s resignation (CE01)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 1)

According to Table 1-2, the affair was portrayed as an ‘extra-marital affair’, ‘salacious revelation’ and ‘celebrity gossip’. Chuang’s views of it were described as ‘complicated’, ‘sharing friendship’, ‘no romantic relationship’, ‘sexual attraction’, ‘enjoying the ride’, and ‘no emotion’, according to her interview on TVNZ One (see Table 1-2). Chuang was said to have remained in a close relationship with Brown only because of his ‘intoxicating influence’ (see Table 1-1). After the affair was exposed, it was said that Chuang ‘called for Len Brown’s resignation’ and ‘did not miss him’ (see Table 1-2). This represented Chuang as being heartless towards Brown.
According to Table 1-3, Brown was identified as a ‘married’ man and an aspiring ‘right-wing politician.’ The Herald reported that, after the exposure, his resignation was ‘called for’ and ‘anticipated’, and he was ‘censured’ by his council (see Table 1-3). Brown was reported as having ‘confirmed’ he had provided a reference for Chuang to help her to get a job in the Auckland Art Gallery in July 2011, two months after the affair began. After the exposure, Brown replied ‘no’ and ‘ruled out’ Chuang’s reappointment to another job on the advisory panel, but ‘changed his position’ later and said that he ‘would be directed’ by the selection panel and ‘not be involved’ in the recruitment process (see Table 1-3). By quoting Chuang, the Herald said that Brown used ‘the mayoral car’ to drive her around and ‘had bought her gifts’. On the other hand, the news stories also quoted the mayoral spokesman as saying that Brown often ‘gives lifts to colleagues, friends and associates’ to and from occasions in ‘a reasonable way.’ Regarding the free rooms that hotels (insisted) on offering the pair,
Brown was described as being ‘uncomfortable’ with it and stressing that ‘any expenses’ in the liaison should be ‘paid out of his own pocket’; still, he was ‘in the inquiry’ (see Table 1-3).

SkyKiwi.com

The 10 news items published on SkyKiwi.com were illustrated with 19 news pictures and five screenshots relevant to the Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair. TV3 News, the Herald, Stuff.co.nz, the Whale Oil blog, WTV7, and Metro magazine were the main sources of its quotes (see Appendix 2). The SkyKiwi.com news reports on the case focused on the portrayal of Chuang by describing her situation after the exposure of the affair, her past experiences, and her attitude towards the affair. Brown was also represented in these news stories. It is worth noting that the roles of Luigi Wewege, John Palino and the Whale Oil blog were emphasised frequently. In addition, the term ‘extra-marital affair gate’ (外遇門) was used for the affair. The suffix ‘-gate’, derived from the Watergate8, follows a noun or name and is synonymous with ‘scandal’, especially for political events and stories. As the journalist Hao Peng (浩彭), who wrote all of these news stories about the affair, explained in the interview as part of this study:

“We use quotation marks and the phrase “extra-marital affair gate” to name the incident because we believe that, for the Chinese community and the mainstream society, the subject of this incident was Brown; this was a public occurrence or a political occurrence rather than a private problem. The dispute was about Brown’s misuse of public assets.”

7 WTV 中華電視網 is New Zealand’s largest Chinese television network, launched in June 2000. Link: http://en.wtvistan.co.nz/
8 For more information about the suffix ‘-gate’ please see the Oxford English Dictionary; Watergate refers to the political scandal that broke in 1972 (Schudson, 2004)
Peng has had eight years’ experience as a journalist in mainland China and three years in New Zealand. Due to the limited size of SkyKiwi.com, Peng was in charge of all the news reports about the Brown and Chuang affair, including the choice of news footage and reporting angles.

Table 2-1. The representation of Chuang extracted from SkyKiwi.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Bevan Chuang</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Childhood (CC04)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father’s little princess</td>
<td>Father’s pride</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abandoned</td>
<td>Battle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moving frequently</td>
<td>Sad mother</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old grandmother</td>
<td>Language issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hard work</td>
<td>Nervousness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adult Chuang (CC04)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No sense of safety</td>
<td>Psychological treatment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barely ever refuses</td>
<td>Attempt to please other people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chuang after the affair’s exposure</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contemplating suicide (CC04)</td>
<td>Desperation (CC04)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxious (CC04)</td>
<td>Lonely (CC04)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No social life (CC05)</td>
<td>Being single (CC05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Want to apologise (CC01) (CC10)</td>
<td>respect for Brown (CC01) (CC06)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 2)

In Table 2-1, it can be seen that Chuang was portrayed as a vulnerable and helpless young woman. In her childhood, Chuang was depicted as her father’s ‘little princess’ and ‘pride’ until he ‘abandoned’ her. After that, Chuang’s childhood life in New Zealand became a ‘battle’ as she was ‘moving frequently’, with a ‘sad mother’, ‘old grandmother’, ‘language issues’, ‘hard work’ and ‘nervousness’. Pointing to these experiences, the news reports illustrated that Chuang had grown into a woman with
‘no sense of safety’ who needed ‘psychological treatment’, ‘barely ever refused’ and ‘attempted to please other people’ (see Table 2-1). After the exposure of the affair, Chuang was represented as ‘contemplating suicide’, feeling ‘desperation’ and being ‘anxious’ and ‘lonely’ (see Table 2-1). In addition, the reports pointed out that Chuang had ‘no social life’ and was ‘being single’ because of the affair going public. Chuang was described as ‘wanting to apologise’ to Brown’s family and still having ‘respect for’ Brown (see Table 2-1).

Table 2-2. The representation of Chuang extracted from the SkyKiwi.com

| Bevan Chuang |
|-----------------|-----------------|
| **Chuang’s relationship with Len Brown** | |
| Really in love (CC04) | No regrets (CC04) |
| A good memory (CC04) | Relaxing and feeling safety (CC04) |
| Not right (CC10) | Learned a lesson from it (CC10) |
| **Chuang’s relationship with Luigi Wewege** | |
| Ex-boyfriend (CC03) | Promised to marry Chuang (CC04) |
| Naively (CC10) | Misunderstood true love (CC10) |
| Lack of ability to protect herself (CC10) | Lack of judgement (CC10) |

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 2)

In the SkyKiwi.com news items, phrases like ‘really in love’, ‘no regrets’, ‘a good memory’ and ‘relaxing and feeling safety’ (see Table 2-2) were employed to describe Chuang’s relationship with Brown. Nevertheless, the articles showed Chuang as knowing that her relationship with Brown was ‘not right’ and as having ‘learned a lesson from it’ (see Table 2-2). In terms of another relationship, that between her and Luigi Wewege, the SkyKiwi.com news articles reported that Wewege was her ‘ex-boyfriend’ and had ‘promised to marry Chuang’ (see Table 2-2). The news reports also
claimed that Chuang ‘naively’ ‘misunderstood’ Wewege as her ‘true love’ and showed ‘lack’ of ‘judgement’ and ‘ability to protect herself’ (see Table 2-2) in this relationship. The opinions expressed in the items continually emphasised the vulnerable nature of Chuang’s role throughout the incident. It should be noted that Chuang’s criminal past, a negative story, was only mentioned in a small paragraph on SkyKiwi.com, the purpose of which was to show that Chuang was not sure whether Brown knew about her criminal record and that she had paid a NZ$ 1,000 fine (see article CC01 Appendix 2).

SkyKiwi.com demonstrated that the exposure of the affair had some positive effects on Chuang and on the Chinese community in New Zealand. The first positive effect was that Chuang became a ‘well-known person’ within the Chinese community, and could ‘spend more time’ with family and friends (see article CC10, Appendix 2). The second positive effect was that Chuang’s story may have attracted the Chinese diaspora to interpret and participate in New Zealand politics more (see article CC09, Appendix 2).

As for the visual depictions of Chuang in the news reports, three types of pictures were used. The first showed Chuang in dark clothes and without any facial expression, which made her appear helpless and desperate. These pictures were used to emphasise that she was manipulated by Palino’s team for political purposes. This can be seen in the early news items as well as the articles CC06, CC07, and
Chapter Five

CC08, reported on January 7th, February 8th, and March 17th, 2014 respectively (see Appendix 5-2). The second type of pictures showed Chuang in a light grey shirt looking at the camera with a smile and was used to report on her failure to reclaim her former position on the Ethnic People’s Advisory Panel. The third type of photos showed her in bright garments with full makeup and dyed hair. These were published on November 27th, 2013 and April 3rd, 2014 and portrayed her as a brave woman positively facing the future (see Appendix 5-2).

On SkyKiwi.com, the news articles CC05, CC06, CC07, CC08, and CC09 (see Appendix 2) used the same news pictures as the Herald news reports CE10, CE11, CE12, CE13, and CE14 (see Appendix 1). However, their headlines had been developed and modified according to the SkyKiwi.com news report’s own goal(s). An example of this is the headlines in the articles CCO5 on SkyKiwi.com and CE10 in the Herald. CCO5 described Chuang’s career as ‘being destroyed’ (see Appendix 1); on the other hand, CE10 with its headline Chuang ‘pays price’ because of the affair (see Appendix 2). Another example is the news reports CC08 and CE13, both reporting that Chuang had spoken in support of cyber-bullying laws. However, CC08 on SkyKiwi.com emphasised that Chuang herself ‘suffered’ from net bullies, while CE13 in the Herald said that she ‘slams’ net bullies (reference the code CC08 in Appendix 2; code CE13 in Appendix 1). It can be observed that the news reports on SkyKiwi.com often used the passive voice to describe Chuang’s circumstances in order to deepen the audience’s impression of her as a vulnerable victim. In addition, the words ‘being
used’ and ‘being manipulated’ (see articles CC01, CC02, Appendix 2) were frequently employed on SkyKiwi.com.

Table 2-3. The representation of the affair extracted from SkyKiwi.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Affair</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chuang’s attitudes</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Always refused (CC01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out of control (CC01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regret (CC04)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The role of Luigi Wewege</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persuade (CC01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plan(CC01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claimed no knowledge about Chuang and Brown’s affair (CC03)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Wewege’s reaction towards his relationship with Chuang</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denied (CC01) (CC03)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The role of John Palino Team</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manipulator (CC01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>John’s reaction towards his team’s relationship with Chuang</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admitted Chuang’s participation (CC01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admitted discussion with Chuang (CC03)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The role of Whale Oil (CC01)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media exposure vehicle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admitted discussing the affair with Wewege</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff being together with Chuang</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 2)

Next to using the term ‘extra-marital affair gate’ to describe the incident, the SkyKiwi.com news reports paid more attention to the role of John Palino’s election team and the Whale Oil blog’s team in the affair. The journalist Peng also claimed that in the interview as part of this research:

“In the series of news reports about Chuang, letting the Chinese community know New Zealand political processes and understand the local government election seemed to be more important than the incident itself."
According to Table 2-3, the ‘ex-boyfriend’ (see table 2-2) Wewege was said to have ‘persuaded’ and ‘forced’ Chuang to publicise her relationship with Brown and ‘planned’ to ‘destroy’ Brown’s reputation (see Table 2-3). He was also reported as ‘denying’ his relationship with Chuang and ‘claiming’ no knowledge about the Chuang and Brown affair until it was reported by the Whale Oil blog. John Palino was described as ‘admitting’ and then ‘denying’ Chuang’s participation in his mayoral election bid and ‘admitting’ and then ‘denying’ his discussion with Chuang as well (see Table 2-3). These conflicting statements seemed to call into question Palino and his team’s reliability so that Chuang’s image as a conned, innocent girl were strengthened. In addition, Palino’s team was represented as a ‘manipulator’ on SkyKiwi.com (see Table 2-3). The Whale Oil blog was represented as a ‘media exposure vehicle’. The owner, Cameron Slater, having had close relations with John Palino’s election team, admitted discussing the affair with Wewege (see Table 2-3). Following the news item about Chuang having experienced ‘harassment’ from Palino’s team, Slater responded that he ‘could not see where harassment is coming from’ because of Slater’s team ‘paying for Chuang’s hiding room in a hotel’ and his staff ‘being together with Chuang’ after the exposure of the affair (see Table 2-3). This seems to indirectly exemplify Slater’s team’s links with Palino’s team, emphasising Chuang’s role of vulnerable victim. Similarly, Palino was also said to have helped Wewege to respond that he and Chuang were ‘only friends’ on SkyKiwi.com (see Table 2-3).

In addition, the words used to describe Chuang’s attitude towards the affair
going public were used to underline her passive role. The articles CC01, CC04, and CC10 said that she ‘always refused’ to expose her relationship with Brown until the situation got ‘out of control’ ‘under pressure’ from John Palino’s team (see Table 2-3).

The news articles repeatedly said that, although she publicised her relationship with Brown ‘without intention’ and felt ‘regret’, she still felt ‘liberation’ (see Table 2-3) because she had tried to break up the relationship with Brown many times previously.

Table 2-4. Chuang’s nine statements extracted from SkyKiwi.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chuang’s Nine Statements (Chinese)</th>
<th>Chuang’s Nine Statements (English)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. 我 keenly regretted publicising my relationship with Brown.</td>
<td>1. I keenly regretted publicising my relationship with Brown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. 我 was forced to publicise it because of threats and abuse.</td>
<td>2. I was forced to publicise it because of threats and abuse.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. 我 was manipulated by the owner of the blog which first published the affair; I was quoted</td>
<td>3. I was manipulated by the owner of the blog which first published the affair; I was quoted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mistakenly.</td>
<td>mistakenly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. 我 never got any job offers because of him, even on the Ethnic Panel. This is supported by</td>
<td>4. I have no conflict of interest with the mayor; he was only my referee; Whatever the position,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>official evidence;</td>
<td>in the art gallery or other jobs, he and four other people were only my referees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. 我 have had no support or protection from Palino’s team after the exposure of the affair.</td>
<td>5. I never got any job offers because of him, even on the Ethnic Panel. This is supported by</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Stephen Cook, many years ago, once used illegal media strategies to drive a woman to suicide.</td>
<td>official evidence;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. I’m so silly, being tricked and I feel regret. There are few people who know what I really do</td>
<td>7. This incident is completely for political purposes, is a game Palino and Cam Slater are</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for the Chinese community.</td>
<td>playing to take the mayor down.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

WTV Website Screenshots

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CC02 Screenshots: Chuang’s Nine Statements (Chinese)</th>
<th>CC02 Screenshots: Chuang’s Nine Statements (English)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18 October 2013</td>
<td>18 October 2013</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 2)
The visual materials included one screenshot of Chuang’s *Nine Statements* (see above Table 2-4), which was from the WTV\(^9\) website and used in the SkyKiwi.com news story on October 18th, 2013. In the statements, Chuang appeared to depict herself as a victim and an honest person, who never intended to publicise her relationship with Brown or to use Brown’s influence in politics. Chuang declared that going public with the affair was ‘forced’ and due to being ‘threatened’ and ‘abused’ by Palino and Cameron Slater’s teams; she had ‘had no protection and support’ from them (see Table 2-4). These statements not only reiterated Chuang’s passive and vulnerable role, but also underlined the close relations between Palino, Wewege and Slater. Chuang also said that there was ‘no conflict of interest’ between her and Brown. This may be an indirect response to the *Herald*’s portrayal of her relationship with Brown as merely the result of an ‘intoxicating influence’ (see Table 1-1).

*Table 2-5. The representation of Brown extracted from SkyKiwi.com*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Len Brown</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>As a lover of Chuang (CC10)</strong></td>
<td><strong>As a father</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devious</td>
<td>Sophisticated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good at using his power</td>
<td>Daughters’ pride (CC01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>As a Mayor</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of judgement (CC05)</td>
<td>Lack of credibility (CC05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100% contribution to serve the country (CC01)</td>
<td>Family’s supports (CC01)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 2)

On SkyKiwi.com, Chuang was quoted as describing Brown as ‘devious’, ‘sophisticated’ and ‘good at using his power’ in their relationship (see Table 2-5). On the other hand, five city councillors were quoted as saying they thought Brown showed

---

\(^9\) Refer to footnote 8
‘lack of judgement and credibility’. The news also reported a decrease in the outcry for Brown’s resignation because of his ‘family’s support’. His daughter was reported as saying that she believed that Brown, as the mayor, made a ‘100% contribution to serve the country’; as ‘a father’, he was his ‘daughters’ pride’ (see Table 2-5).

The photos of Brown on SkyKiwi.com showed that his life and career seemed not to be affected by the exposure. The first photo of Brown in SkyKiwi.com news on October 17th, 2013 (see CC01 Photos, Appendix 5-2) showed him and his daughter standing together happily. The second photo, on October 18th, 2013, displayed him wearing a suit, holding a file and walking down the street confidently (see CC02 Photos, Appendix 5-2). The third picture of Brown, one with a smirk, was used along with the article published on November 27th, 2013 (see CC04 Photos, Appendix 5-2). Brown in these photos seemed to be living as usual with family support and confidence at work. Compared with the photos of Chuang as vulnerable and suffering, these photos repeatedly emphasised Chuang’s role as a ‘victim’ in the affair and may have stimulated audiences to feel sympathy for her. SkyKiwi.com only used a small photo of Brown and Chuang together, which appeared to reflect Peng’s description that he saw the affair as a story background of this news occurrence and did not emphasise Brown and Chuang’s relationship in his reports.
Case two: Chinese visitors dining at the Christmas charity lunch in 2012

The New Zealand Herald

Two news items, each with a picture, about the Chinese tourists dining at the Christmas charity lunch in Auckland were collected from the Herald. One news commentary, written by Diane Robertson, with one picture was also collected as well. Diane Robertson was leader of the Auckland City Mission and the organiser of this lunch. TVNZ was the Herald’s main sources of information (see Appendix 3). The two news reports, published on December 27th, 2012 and January 5th, 2013, identified the nature of the event and the elderly Chinese people at the lunch. Both articles reported the public’s reaction as well as the event sponsors’ reactions to the incident. The commentary, published on January 12th, 2013, indicated Robertson’s personal opinions about the event.

Table 3-1. The representation of the Chinese extracted from the Herald

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elderly Chinese people at the Charity Lunch</th>
<th>Mr Xi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chinese tourists (VE01) (VE02)</td>
<td>One of the Chinese tourists (VE02) In his 50s (VE02) From Wuhan (VE02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being conned (VE02)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On organised tours (VE01) (VE02)</td>
<td>Could afford airfares to New Zealand (VE01) Holding ADS tours Visa (VE02) Decide to extend his visit (VE02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Should not be given free lunch (VE01)</td>
<td>Misused/Marred (VE03)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The tour operator</th>
<th>The tour operator’s offers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Irresponsible (VE02)</td>
<td>Rogue (VE02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-licensed organization (VE02)</td>
<td>Taking advantage of Christmas charity (VE01) Spoke Mandarin (VE02) Local guide (VE02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xing Yu (Lucky Jade) Sightseeing (VE02)</td>
<td>Called into question (CE03) Free public facilities (VE02) Charitable events (VE02)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to Table 3-1, in the *Herald*, the elderly Chinese people dining at the charity lunch were defined as ‘Chinese tourists’ ‘on organised tours’, who ‘could afford airfares to New Zealand’ and ‘should not be given a free lunch’. In addition, Mr Xi, one of the ‘Chinese tourists’, was described in detail. Article VE02 indicated that Mr. Xi, ‘in his 50s’ and ‘from Wuhan’, came to New Zealand ‘holding an Approved Destination Status (ADS) tours Visa’\(^{10}\) (see Table 3-1). He met a Chinese guide in front of ‘i-Site Visitor Information Centre’ in Quay Street after ‘deciding to extend his visit’ to New Zealand. The news reported that Mr. Xi was ‘attracted by’ a ‘real bargain’ and that the services were to be provided by a ‘handy local guide’ who ‘spoke Mandarin’. Robertson said these people had ‘misused’ the Auckland City Mission and ‘marred’ a wonderful day.

The tour operator was identified in the *Herald* as being from ‘Xing Yu (Lucky Jade) Sightseeing’ and was represented as ‘irresponsible’, and a ‘rogue’, and a representative of ‘non-licensed organizations’ who ‘took advantage of Christmas charity’ (see Table 3-1). The majority of services offered by the tour operator were ‘not meant for tourists’, such as ‘free public facilities’ and ‘charitable events’ (see Table 3-1). Robertson commented that the tour operator’s actions ‘has called into question’ the

---

integrity of tour operators. However, it is worth noting that Roberson did not use the word ‘Chinese’ to identify the tour operator in her article.

**Table 3.2. The mainstream society reactions extracted from the Herald**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The mainstream society responses</th>
<th>Auckland City Missioner: Diane Robertson (VE01)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public reactions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outbursts of concern (VE01)</td>
<td>Not worried about others looking at how we care for people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angry reaction (VE01)</td>
<td>Wished them to give money in return</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widespread outrage (VE02)</td>
<td>Not aware of foreign tour groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sponsors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No sponsor with concerns (VE01)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 3)

The ‘Chinese tourists’ were reported as ‘being conned’ (see Table 3-1), however ‘outbursts of concern’, an ‘angry reaction’ and ‘widespread outrage’ (see Table 3-2) were demonstrated by the public in television reports, online forums and talkback radio. The leader of the Auckland City Mission, Diane Robertson was reported as being ‘not aware of foreign tour groups’ and had a moderate and sympathetic reaction towards the incident. For example, the *Herald* on December 27th, 2012 reported that Robertson was ‘not worried’ about some unexpected attendees and was ‘looking at how we care for people’, but still ‘wished’ that those who sent the tour group to the lunch would ‘give money in return’ (see Table 3-2). Regarding the sponsors’ reaction, the news reported that ‘no sponsor’ had contacted Diane with ‘concerns’. In addition in the *Herald* news stories the charity lunch was described as being ‘for people unable to afford a Christmas meal’ and ‘for the poor and homeless’ (see Article VE02, Appendix 3).
None of the Chinese tourists at the lunch were visible in the three pictures published in the *Herald*. In total three news photos were collected in this study. The first, used in article VE01 on December 27th, 2012, “City Mission to tourists: Pay up”, showed about six tables surrounded by people of various ethnicities but only one face close to a television cameraman in the top right corner seemed East Asian. At the centre of the picture was a volunteer in Christmas dress (see Appendix 5-3). The second photo, used in article VE02 on January 5th, 2013, “Tourists: We were conned”, showed many people and many tables, but no Chinese or Asian faces can be identified (see Appendix 5-3). The article VE03 about Robertson’s commentary on January 12th, 2013 used part of the photo in VE02 (see Appendix 5-3).

**SkyKiwi.com**

From SkyKiwi.com, five news stories with four news pictures and 11 screenshots were collected. The main sources quoted were the *Herald*, TVNZ, Chinese Voice Radio\(^\text{11}\), and The United Chinese Press\(^\text{12}\) (see Appendix 4). By discussing and highlighting several contentious points about the descriptions in the *Herald* and some possible reasons about what may have led to the incident, these five news stories described the event as a result of ‘English media’s misunderstanding’ and argued that this incident may be ‘not true’ (see article VC03, Appendix 4).

---

\(^\text{11}\) See footage 13.
\(^\text{12}\) The United Chinese Press, found by NZND Media Ltd, is one of the leading Chinese newspapers based in Auckland.
SkyKiwi.com reported the reactions of the event sponsors and the public towards this incident as well. It is worth noting that though the articles relating to the ‘Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch’ on SkyKiwi.com were categorised as news, many opinions were reported. The SkyKiwi.com journalist Xiaoyu Zou (小宇 鄒), who has had five years experience as a journalist in mainland China and three years in New Zealand, claimed, in the interview of this project, that:

“On this kind of news that leads to some strong reaction within the Chinese community, we hope to reveal as many viewpoints as possible based on people's discussion and users’ opinions on our online forum.”

Table 4-1. Six contentious points extracted from SkyKiwi.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SkyKiwi.com</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Point 1: Authenticity of the tour company</strong></td>
<td><strong>Point 5: The validity of the statements in the mainstream media</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfindable (VC05)</td>
<td>Non-registered (VC05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unrecognised (VC05)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Point 2: The use of visual materials</strong></td>
<td><strong>Point 3: The identity of the ‘Chinese tourists’</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had to leave (VC05)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘ADS Visa’ (VC05)</td>
<td>Less likely to visit i-Site (VC05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No footage (VC05)</td>
<td>No TV images (VC05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No TV images (VC05)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Point 4: The authenticity of Mr. Xi</strong></td>
<td><strong>Point 6: The venue’s situation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Should observe (VC05)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clearly (VC05)</td>
<td>Proactively response (VC05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No check-in records (VC05)</td>
<td>Glass walls (VC05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No identifiable visual materials (VC05)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response from the Herald (VC05)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 4)

According to Table 4-1, six contentious points were reported in the five news
Chapter Five

items on SkyKiwi.com. The first was about the existence and authenticity of the tour company, Xing Yu (Lucky Jade) Sightseeing. The news items reported that this company was ‘unrecognised’ by many Chinese tourism professionals in New Zealand and their counterparts. It was ‘unfindable’ on the official website of the New Zealand Company Office and was a ‘non-registered’ tour operator which was allowed to conduct Chinese tour groups with ADS Visas in New Zealand. The second contentious point was about the use of visual materials on TVNZ One. SkyKiwi.com pointed out that ‘no footage’ established that the Chinese interviewee proved she was a bus tourist. There were also ‘no TV images’ of any streets or car parks near to the lunch venue showing where the Chinese tourists could have been ‘getting off’ the tour bus and ‘entering’ the venue. The third point was about the identity of the ‘Chinese tourists’. Article VC05 reported that ‘one woman’ of the Chinese seniors group in the lunch ‘proactively’ contacted Chinese Voice Radio13 and ‘clarified’ that they were ‘Chinese New Zealanders’ rather than tourists. Articles VC03 and VC04 reiterated and underpinned their identity as ‘Chinese New Zealanders’ by quoting an argument from the SkyKiwi.com online forum that one Chinese elderly woman shown on TVNZ One wore a ‘white sun hat’, which is a ‘typical symbol’ of the ‘New Zealand Chinese seniors’ (see Table 4-1). The fourth point was about the authenticity of Mr. Xi. SkyKiwi.com claimed there were ‘not any identifiable visual materials’ about Mr. Xi in the Herald news reports and that there was ‘no check-in records’ for Mr Xi in any New Zealand

13 Chinese Voice Radio: Called as Chinese Radio Broadcasts, founded by World TV, started its broadcast in February 2004 in Auckland. The company is currently the largest Chinese radio network in New Zealand, operating AM 936, FM 99.4 and FM 104.2 (“Chinese Voice Radio,”). The company profile can be found at http://www.chinesevoice.co.nz/
hotels (see Table 4-1). It is interesting that article VC05 specifically reported that Chinese journalists were trying to ask the *Herald* to offer some evidence that could prove the existence of Mr. Xi and of his tour companions, but received ‘no responses from the *Herald*. The fifth doubt was about the rationality of the *Herald*’s news reports on the Chinese tourists ‘changing travel schedule’ (see Table 4-1). SkyKiwi.com quoted the New Zealand Tourism Administration as saying that the tourists with Approved Destination Status (ADS) Visas ‘have to leave’ the destination at the end of their tour. In other words, according to professionals with rich experience in New Zealand tourism, ‘extending a visit’ was ‘unusual’ and ‘never happened’ because of the policy of the ‘Approved Destination Status (ADS) Visa’ and ‘reservation of flight tickets’ in advance. In addition, SkyKiwi.com said that Chinese tourists who are ‘Mandarin speakers’, are ‘generally less likely’ to visit the i-Site Information Centre because of ‘language issues’ (see Table 4-1). The i-Site Information Centre was identified in the *Herald* as the place where Mr. Xi and his companions met the tour guide. The sixth issue concerned the situation of the charity lunch venue. All the circumstances the *Herald* reported, such as parking spots and vehicles outside the entrance, ‘could have been clearly observed’ because of its ‘glass walls’; but the security guards on duty that day claimed that they ‘did not see’ the Chinese tourists or the bus (see table 4-1). This implied that it would have been impossible for the guards to be unaware of the Chinese tourists and the vehicle if the incident had really taken place as reported. In addition, SkyKiwi.com reported that the security guards ‘politely refused’ to offer the CCTV records for that day (see Table 4-1), which may play a
similar role to the reply of ‘no responses from the Herald’ when Chinese journalists asked for evidence of Mr. Xi (as stated in the fourth point). All these points provided SkyKiwi.com journalists with enough material to question the truthfulness of the news reports about Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch in the Herald.

Table 4-2. Alternative explanations extracted from SkyKiwi.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Possible reasons 1: (VC03)</th>
<th>Possible reasons 3: (VC05)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Communication barrier</td>
<td>Cultural issue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huaren seniors</td>
<td>often</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can’t speak English</td>
<td>Only speak simple English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>habitually</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 4)

Three possible reasons can be seen in Table 4-2, which may have led to what SkyKiwi.com claimed was a ‘misunderstanding of English media’ (see Article VC03, Appendix 4). The first possible reason was language issues as the majority of ‘Huaren\(^{14}\) seniors’ ‘cannot speak’ English or ‘only speak’ simple English, such as ‘yes’ and ‘no’ (see Table 4-2). SkyKiwi.com said this probably resulted in a ‘communication barrier’ with the journalists from the English-language media. The second possible reason was that there was an issue with the environment being ‘so crowded’ and ‘noisy’ in the lunch venue. The news article described the Chinese interviewee as ‘unlikely’ to have ‘listened to’ and ‘understood’ the English journalist’s questions ‘distinctly’. The

\(^{14}\) Huaren means Chinese New Zealanders here.
third possibility was that of cultural issues. It said ‘Huaren’ ‘habitually’ said ‘yes’ to those talking with them in English, whether or not they understood the conversation.

Table 4-3. People’s reactions extracted from SkyKiwi.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Diane Robertson’s responses (VC05)</th>
<th>The public reactions (VC02)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Building connection</td>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demands</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sponsors’ reactions (VC05)</td>
<td>Private profits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not severe</td>
<td>Only</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please reference the codes in Appendix 4)

As for the reactions of Diane Robertson, the sponsors and the public to the incident, according to the news items on SkyKiwi.com as shown in Table 4-3, they seemed more positive and less serious than those described in the *Herald*. Robertson was reported as believing that the participation of Chinese people was a sign of ‘demand’ among them for welfare agencies’ help, which may have ‘built connection’ between the mainstream society and the Chinese community. The sponsors’ reaction was reported as being ‘not severe’, with ‘only’ six complaint letters and ‘only’ two people deciding to no longer donate to the annual charity lunch (see Table 4-3). The ‘Huaren’ donation to the Charity lunch was specially mentioned in following news reports on SkyKiwi.com. The public was represented as ‘worrying about’ the fact that ‘unscrupulous businesses utilised’ ‘the public charitable services’ to pursue ‘private profits’ (see Table 4-3) rather than an ‘angry reaction’. However, on SkyKiwi.com, the public was not identified either as being made up of people from the ‘dominant white group’ or from the Chinese community.
As to the use of visual materials in these five news reports on SkyKiwi.com (see Appendix 5-4), the most frequently used image was a TV screenshot of an old woman with ‘the white hat’ described as a ‘typical symbol’ (see Table 4-1) of New Zealand Chinese seniors. The photo of Diane Robertson smiling was used along with the news item published on February 21st, 2013, saying she supposed that the effect of this incident was ‘not severe.’ It is worth noting that while the news headlines said ‘the poor people crowded into Auckland City Charity lunch yesterday’ without mentioning ‘Chinese tourists’ on December 26th, 2012, the photo with this news article included a group of Asian people sitting around the lunch table (see Appendix 5-4). In contrast, when the news article titled “Chinese Tour Group Dinning at the Charity Lunch Leads to a Controversy” appeared on December 27th on SkyKiwi.com, the news picture did not include any Asian faces (see Appendix 5-4).
Chapter 6: Analysis and Discussion

This chapter will look at the data presented in chapter five on the way SkyKiwi.com responded to the representation of Chinese in the Herald. A comparative analysis, within each case and across cases, will be provided.

The data collected in this project included news reports and news commentaries in the Herald and on SkyKiwi.com. These two types of article are different. News reports are expected to disseminate the factual and accurate information (Hart, 1996; Li, 2005). On the other hand, news columns mostly include the authors’ opinions presented in order to shape and guide the public opinions (Gans, 1979; Li). The data collected from both media outlets about the Brown and Chuang affair only included news reports. However, regarding the case of the Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch, the data collected from the Herald and SkyKiwi.com included news reports and news commentaries. This was because the SkyKiwi news items about this case did not fully conform to the criteria of news. Instead, its news items attempted to structure the truth by quoting many opinions and viewpoints without exactly verifying the speakers’ identities and the sources of their opinions. To balance these descriptions, therefore, the data collected from the Herald included a news commentary along with the data of other news stories.
6-1 Case one: The Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in 2013

Most of the coverage about the Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in the Herald and SkyKiwi.com was significantly different, including the differences in the portrayals of Chuang and Brown, how the affair was identified, and the angles of reporting. It is worth noting that there were other dissimilar elements indicated in these stories, such as the headlines, which will be discussed later. On the other hand, some similarities were included in both media sources.

In the Herald, the affair was identified as a private ‘sex scandal’ and ‘celebrity gossip.’ Bevan Chuang was presented as ‘flirty Brown’s former mistress’, who viewed the affair as one of ‘sexual attraction’ and ‘sharing friendship’ rather than a ‘romantic relationship’ according to a television interview with Chuang. She was also described as feeling ‘no emotion’ for Brown and ‘calling for Len Brown’s resignation’ after the exposure of their two-year extra-marital affair. Specifically, ‘another sexual partner Luigi Wewege’ was used to frame Chuang’s image as a loose woman, who ‘had intimate relationships’ with both Brown and Wewege, Brown’s rival campaign worker. Chuang was also portrayed as a ‘right-wing politician’ and ‘unsuccessful candidate’ in the Auckland local board election. The ‘intoxicating influences’ of Brown’s political successes were identified as the reasons why Chuang was with him. Her dismissal by a Chinese community committee and failure to reclaim her old position on an advisory
panel were also reported in the *Herald*. In addition, the *Herald* devoted three news articles to reporting Chuang’s criminal past and describing her as ‘trying to not disclose and to be clear of’ her criminal record. These news stories were accompanied by photos of Chuang with a crooked smile. The *Herald* described Brown as ‘intending’ to keep his position of mayor and ‘being uncomfortable with free rooms’ offered by the hotels where he and Chuang had met.

On SkyKiwi.com, the affair was represented as a ‘political scandal’ and a ‘public occurrence’ by the addition of the suffix ‘-gate’ after the ‘extra-marital affair.’ Chuang was represented as being passive and as having refused to allow her relationship with Brown to go public until forced to do so by Luigi Wewege, who was described as Chuang’s ‘ex-boyfriend’ on SkyKiwi.com. Indeed, Chuang’s image as a passive victim and a helpless Chinese woman was consistently emphasised in the SkyKiwi.com news articles, exemplified by reporting on her painful childhood experiences and on her as having ‘no sense of safety’ after growing up. Chuang was described as ‘contemplating suicide’ and feeling ‘desperation’ after the exposure. This report was accompanied by images of her wearing dark clothes and looking fearful. Chuang’s criminal past was only reported in a small paragraph on SkyKiwi.com. By quoting Chuang, SkyKiwi.com described Brown as ‘devious’ and ‘good at using his power’ in his extra-marital affair. Surprisingly though some positive effects of the extra-marital affair were also reported in SkyKiwi.com’s news reports.
A number of similarities can be found in the news reports about the Brown and Chuang affair in the *Herald* and on SkyKiwi.com; however, in their parallel stories, it is important to notice that the headlines were quite different. Examples of this are the articles CC05, CC06, CC07, CC08, and CC09 on the SkyKiwi.com and CE10, CE11, CE12, CE13 and CE14 in the *Herald*. These news stories were about Chuang’s career and life after the exposure of her relationship with Brown, for example, accounts of her failure to reclaim her old job on the advisory panel. The texts and pictures in these news stories were similar in both news outlets. However, the strikingly dissimilar headlines remain important. For instance, the news story CE10 in the *Herald* about Chuang being fired by a Chinese community committee used the headline “Chuang pays price for affair”. On the other hand, the headline for the same story on SkyKiwi.com was, “The heroine …. said: My career is destroyed”. The difference between the headlines could be seen as portraying Chuang’s role in two different lights; one is of her as a mistress who deserves some punishment and the other of her is as a helpless woman and a passive victim in the affair. As Bonyadi and Samuel (2013) and Dor (2003) assert, headlines not only get attention from the targeted audience, but can also function as a negotiator between readers and stories, engaging readers so as to “produce the optimal level of affinity”(Dor, p.720) between the text of a news report and the audience’ interpretations. In other words, the use of different headlines can serve to shape the perceptions of the public and bias the audiences’ impressions of similar news texts (Franiuk, Seefelt, & Vandello, 2008). This is especially true for online news audiences, who generally have a low attention span and often only scan
headlines rather than read the whole text (Zomick, 2013). In this way, the headlines of the news stories on SkyKiwi.com about Chuang could be seen as emphasizing an interpretation of her as a passive victim.

Apart from these similar news reports with different headlines, most of the other news reports in the Herald and SkyKiwi.com conflicted significantly. This is particularly true regarding the primary definition of the affair and the coverage of Chuang. The Herald identified the extra-marital affair as a private ‘sexual scandal’, while SkyKiwi.com framed it as a ‘public occurrence’ and a ‘political scandal’. To reinforce its descriptions in these terms, the SkyKiwi.com news reports emphasised the close relationships between the Palino team and the Whale Oil blog team and their intention of ‘destroying’ Brown’s reputation. The Palino team was described as manipulative and the Whale Oil blog was represented as a ‘media exposure vehicle.’

The word ‘mistress’ was frequently used to describe Chuang in the Herald, but in contrast, SkyKiwi.com rarely used the words ‘mistress’ and ‘lover’ in the news stories. SkyKiwi.com Journalist Hao Peng claims, in his interview as part of this project, that:

"We didn’t use ‘mistress’ or ‘lover’ in our news reports. Compared with the mainstream media, our descriptions of the details of the extra-marital affair, for example, that Brown and Chuang had sex in the Town Hall, were quite limited...."

In the Herald, Chuang was framed as a loose woman, for instance, ‘having intimate relationships’ with both Brown and ‘another sexual partner,’ Wewege, Brown’s
rival campaign worker. In comparison, the SkyKiwi.com news stories reported Wewege as Chuang’s ‘ex-boyfriend’ who promised to marry her. In this story, Chuang was depicted as ‘naively misunderstanding’ the nature of her relationship with Luigi Wewege. In the *Herald*, the term an ‘unsuccessful candidate’ (in the Auckland local election) was used to underpin the idea that Chuang was with Brown because of the ‘intoxicating influences’ of his political successes. In contrast, SkyKiwi.com depicted Chuang as being ‘really in love’ and ‘feeling relaxed and safe’ in her relationship with Brown.

The *Herald* news reports exemplified the tendency of media, for which the New Zealand MSM is no exception, to focus on more dramatic news reporting about celebrities, human interest and crimes (Baker & Benson, 2008; Wallis, 2012). This relates to the results of another research study about New Zealand television and the New Zealand Chinese diaspora, undertaken by Wallis, in which Chinese women seemed to be habitually represented as untrustworthy and “potential romantic threats” (p. 36). The *Herald* journalist, Lincoln Tan (specifically interviewed for this research project) said that the *Herald* has its own editorial policy, is guided by the New Zealand Journalist Code of Ethics, and is overseen by national media organisations such as the New Zealand Press Council. Specifically, the New Zealand Journalist Code of Ethics\(^\text{15}\) says that all New Zealand journalists should “report and interpret the news with scrupulous honesty” and should not allow “personal interests” or any “commercial

considerations” to influence their “professional duties” based on the “overriding principles” of respect for truth and the public’s right to information (EMPU, n.d.). The Journalist Code of Ethics also says that “a breach of this Code shall be a breach of the Union's Rules.” Under these regulations, the Herald news reports about the two cases should have disseminated the information honestly in accordance with the five journalistic ‘w’s including who, what, when, where, why, and one ‘h’, how’ (Hart, 1996; Li, 2005).

On the other hand, the SkyKiwi news stories emphatically reported vicarious experience, aiming to shape the public perception of Chuang from other angles, as claimed by Peng. He said:

“By providing more information about Chuang, we hoped we could frame the public impression of her from a different angle rather than always blaming her (as a mistress involved in Brown’s marriage), particularly within the Chinese community …. There was too much invective against Chuang there.”

Vicarious experience means involvement and engagement of the audience to engage with a news story through the highlighting of emotional elements (Baker & Benson, 2008; Comrie, 1996). Baker and Benson cited Wyatt and Badger’s (1993) suggestion that reporting vicarious experience “particularly serves the purpose not only of ‘picturing’ a scene but of conveying other information about a news occurrence” (p. 200). In this sense, by emphatically reporting Chuang as being manipulated by the Palino team and Whale Oil blog teams, the SkyKiwi.com news reports seem to transmit information to the effect that Chuang was a passive victim in the affair who deserved sympathy. In addition, SkyKiwi.com also described Chuang’s painful
childhood experiences and quoted her statement that Brown was ‘good at using his power’ to control her in their relationship so that she could not break up with him. After the exposure of the affair, Chuang was described as contemplating suicide because of her desperation. These narrative approaches directed the audiences’ attention towards an interpretation of the affair which encouraged them to participate vicariously in Chuang’s experiences. As Baker and Benson claim, reporting vicarious experience can cause the actual nature of the event to be lost in the emotional confusion. The SkyKiwi.com news stories about the affair inspire the audience to have certain emotional responses towards Chuang, such as sympathy with her, rather than constant blaming of her behaviour.

6-2 Case two: The Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch in 2012

The news reports in the Herald and on SkyKiwi.com about the Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch in 2012 were contradictory. Examples of this are the identification of the Chinese group as ‘Chinese tourists’ in the Herald but as ‘Chinese New Zealanders’ on SkyKiwi.com. In fact, the SkyKiwi.com news reports raised several possible reasons, drawn from its online users, to explain this incident as being the result of a misunderstanding.

In the Herald, it was framed as a story about a group of Chinese people conned into taking advantage of the Christmas charity services. Members of the group of
elderly Chinese people were identified as ‘tourists’ who attended the lunch ‘on an organised tour.’ The Herald described one of them, Mr Xi, in detail saying that he held an Approved Destination Status Visa (ADS). Reporting of details in the news stories can affirm the authenticity of a story and attract readers’ interests at the same time (Tian, 2002). The tour company was depicted as an ‘irresponsible Chinese tour operator.’ The Herald also reported that the majority of services provided by this Chinese tour operator, such as ‘free public facilities’, were ‘not meant for tourists.’ Leader of the Auckland City Mission Dianne Robertson said ‘the actions of the tour operator has called into question the integrity of tour operators.’ She also claimed that the group of people ‘had misused’ the Auckland City Mission and ‘marred’ a wonderful day. The Herald reported the incident as having caused ‘widespread outrage’ and ‘outbursts of concern’ in mainstream society. However, Robertson was described as having ‘no worries’ about the unexpected attendees participating in the charity lunch, merely ‘wishing’ that they would ‘give money in return’. The reaction of the sponsors of the lunch was reported only by saying that sponsors did not contact the Auckland City Mission with any concerns.

The SkyKiwi.com news reports said the Herald’s report was based on a misunderstanding. It said that the group of people at the charity lunch were ‘Chinese New Zealanders’. A woman of this group was reported as having contacted Chinese Voice Radio to clarify this. The tour operator was described on SkyKiwi.com as being ‘unrecognised’ by many Chinese tourism professionals in New Zealand and also
‘unfindable’ on the official website of New Zealand Companies Office. The public was reported as ‘worrying about the unscrupulous businesses utilising public charitable services to pursue private profits’ on SkyKiwi.com. The event sponsors’ reactions were described as being ‘not severe.’ Diane Robertson was reported as believing that the participation of the Chinese at the Christmas lunch ‘built connections’ between mainstream society and the Chinese community in New Zealand. In addition, SkyKiwi.com questioned the validity of the descriptions in the Herald by quoting comments of its online users. For example, problems with the story were described as being caused by communication barriers, as well as culture and environmental issues.

There were a few similarities between the Herald and SkyKiwi.com about the incident. One such similarity was the reporting on Diane Roberson’s view of such participation. Both media outlets reported her as having a moderate and understandable reaction. Another similarity was the reaction of the event sponsors in the charity lunch. Both media outlets said that ‘no sponsor’ had contacted the Auckland City Mission with any severe concerns. However, the contribution of a Chinese sponsor to the charity lunch was reported in the SkyKiwi.com news stories but not in the Herald.

A number of striking differences appeared in the Herald and SkyKiwi.com reports, including discrepancies in the portrayals of the group of Chinese, the tour operator, and the public reactions. The phrase ‘a group of Chinese tourists’ was used
to identify the people dining at the charity lunch in the *Herald*, while SkyKiwi.com depicted them as ‘Chinese New Zealanders’ by quoting the views of its online users. The term Chinese New Zealanders seems to redefine the nature of the group and the incident, stimulating a new consideration that these people (the Chinese New Zealanders) may also be a vulnerable group, who were actually targeted by the charitable service. The name of the Chinese tour operator was reported by the *Herald* as Xing Yu (Lucky Jade) Sightseeing, while the SkyKiwi.com news reports said that this company could not be verified because it could not be found on the official website of the New Zealand Companies Office, which should include most companies and businesses in New Zealand. Public reaction was described as involving ‘widespread outrage’ in the *Herald*, whereas the SkyKiwi.com news stories merely used the word ‘worry’ to describe the public reaction towards the incident.

The *Herald* news reports seemed to conform to western media values and criteria, such as reference to elite nations\(^{16}\) and reference to elite people\(^{17}\), which both determine the priority of information reported on by media (Galtung & Ruge, 1965). These are concepts based on the United States [US] experience, but Eadie (2009) said that “news journalism has a broadly agreed set of values” (p.610). As a former British colony, there could be reason to believe that New Zealand MSM generally shares these news criteria with other First World countries like the US, according to

---

\(^{16}\text{Elite nations: stories concerned with global powers receive more attention than those concerned with less influential nations.}\)

\(^{17}\text{Elite people: stories concerned with the rich, powerful, famous and infamous receive increased coverage.}\)
Robie’s (2013) ‘four worlds news values matrix.’ In other words, the New Zealand MSM is primarily connected to and concerned with the ‘white dominant group’ and practices ‘negative other - presentation’ (Cottle, 2000; Wallis, 2012). For instance, in this event, Chinese people and a Chinese organisation were repeatedly described as irresponsible. However, Diane Robertson, as a member of the mainstream society, was reported as showing her understanding reactions towards these Chinese behaviours. This is in line with Cottle’s assertion that, “In general what we find is a preference for those topics (shown in the mainstream media) that emphasise their (ethnic groups) bad actions and our (dominant people) good ones” (p.38).

The SkyKiwi.com news stories demonstrated a certain freedom in their use of sources. As Li (2013) claims, the Chinese ethnic media in New Zealand normally operate in a “regulatory vacuum” (p. 36). SkyKiwi.com quoted many perceptions and much material from its online users and other Chinese people without verifying their identities. For example, an opinion that white sun hats were the ‘typical symbol of the New Zealand Chinese seniors’ was quoted from an unidentified online user. An image of a ‘white sun hat’ worn by a woman in the group at lunch was frequently used in the SkyKiwi.com news reports.

Quoting opinions, discussion, and resources from the online forum seemed to be a significant part of the news practices on SkyKiwi.com. Journalist Xiaoyu Zou (小宇 鄒) said in the research interview:
“Because we are a news website with a great active online forum, there would have been some relevant voice or discussions on the forum if the incident had become heated. Under the circumstances, following these sources, information and people who posted on our online forum, we contacted them and made our own news reports.”

Zou said SkyKiwi.com news pursued a targeted audience-oriented description, which means that recognising what content the targeted audience expected was crucial. Collecting viewpoints and information from its online forum can be understood as the most effective way to gain this information. However, Carleton (1994), Garrison (2000), Gulati and Garino (2000) believe that the reliability and accuracy of the online information must be acknowledged as a most serious issue for journalists gathering information, due to the fact that numerous factors, such as anonymity and individual’s intentions, may influence its validity.

Zou said that SkyKiwi.com did not identify the people whose online opinions it quoted, stating, “Instead, we only wrote something like, ‘someone calling herself/himself as …. ‘”. Phrases such as ‘a lot of online users deem…’ and ‘an unidentified person claims….’ frequently appeared in the SkyKiwi.com news reports about the Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch. In this sense, they were acting completely contrary to what is expected of good journalistic practice in New Zealand.

6-3 The comparison between the news reports on SkyKiwi.com

By comparing the various news reports on SkyKiwi.com, two strategies can be identified to assuage the feelings of the Chinese diaspora and to counteract negative
emotions within the Chinese community which may be generated by the negative representations about both events in the *Herald*. At the same time, these strategies explain the important role SkyKiwi.com played in response to the representation of Chinese in the *Herald*.

The first strategy is selectivity of information for pre-determined goals. Both Xiaoyu Zou (小宇 鄒) and his colleague Hao Peng (浩 彭), (Peng was in charge of the stories about Brown and Chuang), had worked in mainland Chinese media many years before arriving in New Zealand. Keeping in mind their background, it is not surprising that their news practices in New Zealand still followed Chinese media criteria in regards to, for example, selecting facts to pursue some pre-determined goals (Martin & Chaudhary, 1983). In other words, while some information on SkyKiwi.com was selected and highlighted in the news reports, other facts appear to have been purposefully ignored. In terms of the Brown and Chuang case, for instance, to reach its goal of portraying Chuang as a victim deserving of sympathy, SkyKiwi.com selectively reported on the dominant role of the Palino and the Whale Oil blog teams. With quotes from Chuang, Brown was constantly described as ‘devious’ and ‘good at using his power’ to control Chuang in their relationship. To strengthen the effects of these descriptions on the readers, Chuang’s painful childhood experiences were also reported emphatically. On the other hand, Chuang’s criminal past, reported by the *Herald* in three news articles, was ignored in the SkyKiwi.com news stories except for one small paragraph. Regarding the Chinese people dining at the charity lunch, the
image of the ‘white sun hat’ and the opinion that it was a typical symbol of elderly Chinese New Zealanders appeared frequently in the SkyKiwi.com news reports, serving to contribute to the goal of depicting the incident as a ‘misunderstanding’ by the Herald.

The SkyKiwi.com news reports also selectively introduced some positive understandings of both events, which may contribute toward creating a less negative image of the Chinese community in New Zealand, such as Robertson’s view about the participation of Chinese attendees. Respecting the Brown and Chuang affair, an important positive effect is the possibility that Chuang’s story may have drawn the Chinese diaspora to better understand and participate in New Zealand politics.

In addition, choosing to quote certain statements from the Herald could also be part of the selective strategy. In other words, when the texts in the English-language media benefited and supported the goals of SkyKiwi.com’s news reports, the SkyKiwi.com journalists, more often than not, quoted directly rather than paraphrasing from the Herald. For instance, the Herlad reported that Robertson was ‘not aware of foreign tour groups’ appearing at the charity lunch and that Brown’s credibility was questioned by the councillors after the affair was exposed. Both of these things were directly cited by SkyKiwi.com.

The second strategy, used in SkyKiwi.com’s reporting of both events, was to
pursue targeted audience-oriented descriptions. The targeted audience of the Chinese ethnic media in New Zealand is recognised by Li (2013) as the first generation of the recent Chinese immigrants and Chinese newcomers, who generally have not acculturated much in New Zealand mainstream society and retain some obvious Chinese cultural characteristics, such as collectivism (Li). In other words, there is strong fear among this group about losing face and they are very sensitive to any negative reports about their community published by MSM. To attract these readers, SkyKiwi.com journalist Zou said that the company had adopted a number of themes, including:

- Chinese deceiving the New Zealand social welfare system
- The exploitation of migrants
- Immigration agencies and international students’ agencies
- Chinese woman having relationships with non-Chinese men

Zou also said that the invocation of these themes helped SkyKiwi.com reporters to directly address points about which the targeted audience was sensitive and keep their market share, which leads them to quote discussions and opinions from its online forum. In fact SkyKiwi.com, as an important source of Chinese ethnic media in New Zealand, uses the above themes to categorise news about the Chinese diaspora. In previous research studies, these themes had only been identified in New Zealand MSM where they informed some biased representation in their news outputs of an unfamiliar ethnic community (Baken & Benson, 2008; Wallis, 2012).

These strategies may serve to demonstrate two roles SkyKiwi.com played in
response to the representation of the Chinese diaspora in the *Herald*. The first role is guiding the audience to understand the events from a different angle to the MSM, demonstrated by the SkyKiwi.com’s significant selectivity of information for the pre-determined goals. The second role is providing an independently alternative media space in which the Chinese diaspora in New Zealand can represent themselves in their own words. This role is illustrated by SkyKiwi.com’s audience-oriented strategy, which meets the demands of the Chinese audience and highlights their voices. This is analogous to the conclusions of some previous research projects conducted by Browne (2005), Georgiou (2005), Matsaganis et al., (2010), Ojo (2006) and Li (2013).

Nonetheless, it can be argued that, compared with the journalistic standards of New Zealand, SkyKiwi.com’s news gathering and professional norms still operate in a ‘regulatory vacuum’ (Li) and perhaps need to be improved, particularly in the area of citing and quoting online resources in its news reports.

Apart from these two roles which SkyKiwi.com played in contrast to those of the *Herald*, another role was identified by its journalist Zou during an interview for this project. She said:

“Because we are Chinese language media with a targeted audience of Chinese in New Zealand, the information we can access is more comprehensive than the mainstream media. Under the circumstances...our news reports may also become a resource of the mainstream media when they report some news stories about the Chinese community....in other words, just as we sometimes refer to them (the New Zealand mainstream media), they also refer to our information.....”

However, the *Herald* reporter Lincoln Tan disagreed, saying:
"...I can say for certain that our sub-editors do not read Chinese and would not have been reading SkyKiwi...."

This may stimulate a consideration of Galtung’s centre-periphery model, which emphasised an asymmetrical dominated relationship of centre over periphery (Galtung, 1971 as cited in Thussu, 2000). New Zealand is a predominantly Pākehā society, its English-language media can be defined as a centre; relatively, other ethnic media, such as SkyKiwi.com, can be seen as a periphery. Based on the dominant relationships, the centre’s abandonment of the peripheral interests would be exemplified by the fact that the Herald never read or quoted resources from SkyKiwi.com to assist reporting the Chinese stories. On the other hand, SkyKiwi.com was fully aware of the publication of the Herald and presented it in its own news products. Nevertheless, it is still important to note that, in this project, though SkyKiwi.com quoted descriptions from the Herald, it didn’t reflect the MSM values about the respective occurrences.
Chapter 7: Conclusion

The Chinese diaspora has become an important player in the New Zealand socio-cultural environment. However, according to Wallis (2012), its portrayal in the New Zealand English-language media seems to be negative or simply absent. This qualitative research has explored SkyKiwi.com’s strategies and investigated distinctions between the representation of two news incidents involving Chinese people in SkyKiwi.com and the New Zealand Herald. The main research question for this project was:

What was the role of the Chinese ethnic online news media (as represented by SkyKiwi.Com) in response to the representation of Chinese diaspora in the MSM of New Zealand?

This chapter presents an overall summary of the thesis, answers to the main question and identifies theoretical implications. It also discusses the strengths and limitations of this research. It closes with some suggestions for future directions of research on Chinese ethnic media in New Zealand.

7.1 Thesis overview and closing thoughts

SkyKiwi.com’s portrayals of the Brown and Chuang affair were significantly different from those in the Herald. On SkyKiwi.com, Bevan Chuang was described as
a helpless victim, while the *Herald* portrayed her as a shameless mistress who had sexual relationships with both Brown and a man on his mayoral rival’s staff during the same period. Shaping the image of Chuang as a victim deserving of sympathy seemed to be a determined goal of SkyKiwi.com, because the repeated representations of both the affair and Len Brown demonstrated her as a vulnerable woman. For instance, SkyKiwi.com referred to Chuang as ‘being persuaded and forced’, highlighting how Palino and the Whale Oil blogging team attempted to manipulate her. Towards Brown, SkyKiwi.com devoted many paragraphs and photos depicting him working as usual, enjoying the support of his family and the mayoral office. Indeed, compared with Brown, Chuang appeared to have little support after the affair went public and lost her job working on the Chinese Community Committee, which shaped her image as a pitiable figure in the media. Some of SkyKiwi.com’s headlines about Chuang were in the passive tense, perhaps reinforcing the conceptualisation of Chuang as a passive victim, so disimilar to the image created of her in the *Herald*. For example, the stories about Chuang losing her job on the Chinese Ethnic Committee were headlined on SkyKiwi.com as “Chuang is Dismissed by….” and “Her Career is Destroyed…”, but in the *Herald* as “Chuang Pays Price for Affair”. SkyKiwi.com’s headlines served the purpose of representing Chuang as a victim because headlines are an effective intervention in readers’ interpretation of occurrences, especially for online news audiences, who sometimes only scan headlines rather than reading through the full stories (Franiuk, Seefelt, & Vandello, 2008; Zomick, 2013).
In reporting about the Chinese tourists dining at the charity lunch, unlike the Herald, which strictly distinguishes between news and commentaries in its media practice, SkyKiwi.com blurred the boundaries between them. This means including many perceptions of un-named people and online users, which contributed towards identifying the event as a misunderstanding. For instance, an online opinion that the group of people at the lunch were Chinese New Zealanders stipulated by the picture of an older Chinese woman in a white sunhat, were repeatedly used on SkyKiwi.com. The identity of the diners as Chinese New Zealanders appeared to imply that they may be in genuine need and perhaps legitimate recipients of this charity rather than tourists taking advantage of charitable services, as the Herald reported. To cement this description, SkyKiwi.com reported the organiser of the event, Diane Robertson, as being unaware of any foreign tour groups at the lunch. To further reduce public attention on the Chinese, SkyKiwi.com reported the public reaction towards the event as merely concern about the utilisation of the charity services by an unscrupulous business rather than as a widespread outrage, reported by the Herald.

In approaching both news occurrences, SkyKiwi.com used two strategies, the selection of information for pre-determined goals and an audience-oriented strategy, to frame the stories and shape public opinion within the Chinese community. In answer to the main research question, these strategies fulfilled two of SkyKiwi.com’s roles in responding to the depictions of the Chinese individuals in the Herald.
The first role was that of guiding audiences to understand both stories from angles different to the *Herald*'s. For instance, SkyKiwi.com intended to guide audiences to understand Chuang in the affair as a victim of a political plot rather than a mistress in a sexual scandal, as presented in the *Herald*. With respect to the charity lunch, the SkyKiwi.com news reports were intended to direct audiences to view the incident as a misunderstanding. They did this through raising six points about the *Herald*'s descriptions and offering alternative reasonable explanations about the incident, such as the misunderstanding caused by language barriers. Indeed, these descriptions seemed less offensive than the *Herald*'s and more acceptable to the Chinese community as they are extremely fearful of losing face in New Zealand. Significantly, although the Chinese community is made up of a variety of different nationalities and sometimes demonstrates the distinction between mainland China and other Chinese territories in their media products, SkyKiwi.com did not draw attention to Chuang’s Hong Kong origins but treated her as a compatriot and strived to assist her in winning support and sympathy from the New Zealand Chinese community.

The second role, demonstrated by the audience-oriented strategy, was that of providing the Chinese diaspora with an independent media space in which to portray themselves in their own words (Georgiou, 2005; Ojo, 2006). As the most important media source with its audience as a periphery, SkyKiwi.com included many online readers’ perceptions in its news reports. Such news practices can be understood as a
two-way flow of information between the central media and its periphery, emphasising the empowerment and participation of audiences. However, the practice of quoting unknown audience members’ opinions from online forums is questioned by Gulatin and Garino (2000) and Singer (1995), because the reliability of online discussion posts is easily affected by the anonymity and individual intentions of the online promulgators. In other words, SkyKiwi.com’s style of news gathering and its professional norms are open to debate.

One more role of SkyKiwi.com, identified by its reporter Zou but dismissed by the *Herald* reporter Tan, was to be an information resource for MSM when reporting stories about the New Zealand Chinese community. Tan claims that the *Herald* sub-editors have not referred to SkyKiwi.com’s descriptions of the two incidents. His comments clearly suggest the *Herald*, as an MSM source, does not draw on the Chinese ethnic media. The opposite is true in the case of SkyKiwi.com as it regularly used the *Herald*’s reports. This situation seems to indicate a dominant relationship of the centre over the periphery. Information in the *Herald*, as a central authority, steadily flowed into the periphery; on the other hand, the peripheral SkyKiwi.com could not affect the centre or cause it to reflect the peripheral interests. This may also prove Wallis’s (2012) assertion that the MSM in New Zealand, as a centre, discourages the full incorporation of peripheral minority groups in a Pākehā-dominated society. Certainly, there could be an objective reason for the *Herald* journalist’s dismissal of SkyKiwi.com content, which is that most of them cannot read Mandarin.
In essence, SkyKiwi.com’s reports appear to demonstrate an example of multiple information flows and interactions between many centres and many peripheries. Mathias (2001) asserts that “periphery is a relative term, directly dependent on what is defined as the centre” (p. 16). As seen in this research, the way in which SkyKiwi.com functions both as centre and periphery dependent on the context, shows how these terms are relative, defined by their mutual relationships. SkyKiwi.com, in its second role of providing the Chinese diaspora with a media space, functions as a centre, which implements information exchanges with its audiences on the periphery. At the same time, it is also peripheral to the Herald as a centre, indicating the one-way flow of information from the dominant English-language media to the Chinese ethnic media. However, it is important to note that, even while SkyKiwi.com quoted mainly from the Herald, it did not reflect its values and definitions concerning the two stories. Instead, SkyKiwi.com, as an Auckland-based Chinese ethnic media source, looked to criteria and cultural values typical of media in mainland China, due to the fact that the SkyKiwi.com journalists were trained and worked there before coming to New Zealand. As Thussu (2000) points out, Galtung’s structure theory emphasises the reflection of central value systems and ideologies in the periphery and, in this sense, SkyKiwi.com would certainly be interpreted as peripheral to the mainland media in China.

Thus it can be seen, the singular centre-periphery model does not fully
describe all aspects of the relations between ethnic media and MSM or between ethnic media and its homeland media or between media and audiences because they have become increasingly complicated and multifaceted. As one of the Chinese ethnic media sources in New Zealand, SkyKiwi.com’s roles will shift depending on its counterparts and on its specific news practices. Certainly, whether SkyKiwi.com can eventually implement the role of providing information to the *Herald* or other English-language media depends, firstly, on whether there is sufficient participation by Chinese reporters and editors in mainstream newsrooms and, secondly, on the preferences of the Pākehā group, which is currently the main market targeted by the New Zealand MSM.

7.2 Strengths and limitations

This research aimed to improve understanding of the roles played by SkyKiwi.com in response to the *New Zealand Herald* regarding two news occurrences, as well as to investigate media criteria and news practices. This research provides insight into SkyKiwi.com’s strategies for the formation of public opinion within the Chinese community and assuaging the Chinese people’s emotions towards negative representations of them. This research not only identifies the problems with professional norms in the SkyKiwi.com news practices, such as containing unverified information sources in its reports, but also locates the *Herald*’s problems in reporting ethnic stories, such as lack of materials from the minority communities. This project
re-examines Galtung’s centre-periphery model and demonstrates the complicated relations between different centre(s) and periphery (-ies). It also provides a basis and direction for further research and contributes towards filling the gap in current research about the relationship between Chinese ethnic media in New Zealand and MSM in New Zealand.

This project has its limitations, such as the exclusion of reception analysis, which means the results may not be used to assess the actual audiences’ interpretations of these media products. This research had very little data on the use of visual materials in either media outlets because SkyKiwi.com did not have picture editors and the Herald picture editors declined my invitation to participate in this research. However, future researchers can verify whether these results would generate some meaningful insights.

7.3 Suggestions for future research

This project opens the way for more detailed research into these topics by future investigators. Firstly, as news pictures can arouse emotional reactions in viewers and influence their attitudes towards news stories (Cope et al.; Nabi, 2003), the use of images could be an important object of future research about Chinese ethnic media in New Zealand. Secondly, it has been claimed that negative attitudes about ethnic communities are the result of the predominantly mainstream composition of
audiences in some multicultural societies of Western Europe and North America (Baker & Benson, 2008; Cottle, 2000). Therefore, how such negative attitudes develop in an increasingly multicultural New Zealand should be a direction for future research. Scholars Ojo (2006), Baffoe (2012) and Cottle identify the lack of ethnic diversity in MSM newsrooms as a major cause of the negative portrayals of ethnic groups. Keeping this in mind, thirdly, the proportion of ethnic journalists in the New Zealand MSM and their challenges and roles as they negotiate mainstream society and ethnic communities could be another direction for future research.
References


Cope, J., Fifrick, A., Holl, D., Martin, M., Nunnally, D., Preston, D., . . . Tedesco, A. Image impact in print
media. [A study of how pictures influence news consumers]. Norman, OK, USA: Department of Communication, University of Oklahoma.


References


References


References


## Appendix 1: The Herald's news in terms of the Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Codes</th>
<th>Published Date</th>
<th>Headlines</th>
<th>Links</th>
<th>Quotes Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CE08</td>
<td>Nov 05, 2013</td>
<td>Chuang wants Palino to front up and answer questions</td>
<td><a href="http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&amp;objectid=11151461">http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&amp;objectid=11151461</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE12</td>
<td>Feb 08, 2014</td>
<td>Mayor’s ex-lover wants to reclaim old job on advisory panel</td>
<td><a href="http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&amp;objectid=11198203">http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&amp;objectid=11198203</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Code CE = Chuang English news**
## Appendix 2: SkyKiwi.com news articles in terms of the Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Codes</th>
<th>Published Date</th>
<th>Headlines</th>
<th>Links</th>
<th>Quotes Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CC01</td>
<td>Oct 17, 2013</td>
<td>Brown in the inquiry because of his assistances towards the lover with job application; the heroine said she is used</td>
<td><a href="http://news.skykiwi.com/sh/2013-10-17/168558.shtml">http://news.skykiwi.com/sh/2013-10-17/168558.shtml</a></td>
<td>The NZ Herald/ Stuff/Whale Oil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC02</td>
<td>Oct 18, 2013</td>
<td>Chuang states that the exposure of “the extra-marital affair” is manipulated by Palino’s team</td>
<td><a href="http://news.skykiwi.com/sh/2013-10-18/168628.shtml">http://news.skykiwi.com/sh/2013-10-18/168628.shtml</a></td>
<td>The NZ Herald/WTV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC03</td>
<td>Nov 05, 2013</td>
<td>Palino walking out of shadow; Chuang’s monologue in “the extra-marital affair”</td>
<td><a href="http://ent.skykiwi.com/video_news/2013-11-05/169564.shtml">http://ent.skykiwi.com/video_news/2013-11-05/169564.shtml</a></td>
<td>The NZ Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC05</td>
<td>Dec 22, 2013</td>
<td>the heroine of “the extra-marital affair” dismissed by the Chinese ethnic committee and said: “my career is destroyed”</td>
<td><a href="http://news.skykiwi.com/sh/2013-12-22/172221.shtml">http://news.skykiwi.com/sh/2013-12-22/172221.shtml</a></td>
<td>The NZ Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC06</td>
<td>Jan 07, 2014</td>
<td>The heroine of “the extra-marital affair” considers herself to be politician, claims that “Brown is my role model”</td>
<td><a href="http://imedu.skykiwi.com/news/2014-01-07/172744.html">http://imedu.skykiwi.com/news/2014-01-07/172744.html</a></td>
<td>The NZ Herald/ TV3 News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC07</td>
<td>Feb 08, 2014</td>
<td>The heroine of “the extra-marital affair” makes a comeback, probably reclaims the old position in the Ethnic People Advisory Panel</td>
<td><a href="http://news.skykiwi.com/zh/2014-02-08/174404.shtml">http://news.skykiwi.com/zh/2014-02-08/174404.shtml</a></td>
<td>The NZ Herald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC09</td>
<td>Mar 24, 2014</td>
<td>She’s out! The Heroine of “the extra-marital affair” failed to be part of the Ethnic People Advisory Panel</td>
<td><a href="http://news.skykiwi.com/zh/2014-03-24/176726.shtml">http://news.skykiwi.com/zh/2014-03-24/176726.shtml</a></td>
<td>The NZ Herald</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Code CC = Chuang Chinese News**
Appendix 3: The *Herald's* articles in terms of Chinese tourists dining in the Charity lunch

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Codes</th>
<th>Published Date</th>
<th>Headlines</th>
<th>Links</th>
<th>Quote Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VE02</td>
<td>Jan 05, 2013</td>
<td>Tourist: we were conned</td>
<td><a href="http://www.nzherald.co.nz.nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&amp;objectid=10857382">http://www.nzherald.co.nz.nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&amp;objectid=10857382</a></td>
<td>TVNZ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VE03</td>
<td>Jan 12, 2013</td>
<td>Diane Robertson: we won’t let tour rogue spoil everyone’s big day</td>
<td><a href="http://www.nzherald.co.nz.nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&amp;objectid=10858587">http://www.nzherald.co.nz.nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&amp;objectid=10858587</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Code VE = Visitors English news
Appendix 4: SkyKiwi.com news articles in terms of Chinese tourists dining the Charity Lunch

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Codes</th>
<th>Published Date</th>
<th>Headlines</th>
<th>Links</th>
<th>Quote Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VC03</td>
<td>Dec 28, 2012</td>
<td>Did the MSM misunderstand? Chinese tourists dining in the Charity lunch might be a Rashomon incident</td>
<td><a href="http://imedu.skykiwi.com/news/2012-12-27/152763.html">http://imedu.skykiwi.com/news/2012-12-27/152763.html</a></td>
<td>TVNZ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC04</td>
<td>Jan 05, 2013</td>
<td>Update: They are tourists, but they were conned</td>
<td><a href="http://news.skykiwi.com/na/zh/2013-01-05/152961.shtml">http://news.skykiwi.com/na/zh/2013-01-05/152961.shtml</a></td>
<td>The NZ Herald/TVNZ</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Code VC = Visitors Chinese news
Appendix 5-1: Photos about the Brown and Chuang’s affair extracted from the *Herald*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CE02</th>
<th>CE03</th>
<th>CE04</th>
<th>CE05</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Photo 1" /></td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Photo 2" /></td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Photo 3" /></td>
<td><img src="image4.png" alt="Photo 4" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CE06</th>
<th>CE07</th>
<th>CE09</th>
<th>CE10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image5.png" alt="Photo 5" /></td>
<td><img src="image6.png" alt="Photo 6" /></td>
<td><img src="image7.png" alt="Photo 7" /></td>
<td><img src="image8.png" alt="Photo 8" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CE11</th>
<th>CE12</th>
<th>CE13</th>
<th>CE14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image9.png" alt="Photo 9" /></td>
<td><img src="image10.png" alt="Photo 10" /></td>
<td><img src="image11.png" alt="Photo 11" /></td>
<td><img src="image12.png" alt="Photo 12" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(Reference the article codes to Appendix 1)*
Appendix 5-2: Visual data about the Brown and Chuang affair extracted from the SkyKiwi.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Photos</th>
<th>Screenshots</th>
<th>Photos</th>
<th>Screenshots</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Photo 1" /></td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Screenshot 1" /></td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Photo 2" /></td>
<td><img src="image4.png" alt="Screenshot 2" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image5.png" alt="Photo 3" /></td>
<td><img src="image6.png" alt="Screenshot 3" /></td>
<td><img src="image7.png" alt="Photo 4" /></td>
<td><img src="image8.png" alt="Screenshot 4" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image9.png" alt="Photo 5" /></td>
<td><img src="image10.png" alt="Screenshot 5" /></td>
<td><img src="image11.png" alt="Photo 6" /></td>
<td><img src="image12.png" alt="Screenshot 6" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**CC01 Screenshots**

![Screenshot 1](image1.png)

**CC02 Screenshots**

![Screenshot 2](image2.png)

**CC03 Screenshots**

![Screenshot 3](image3.png)

**CC04 Screenshots**

![Screenshot 4](image4.png)

**CC04 Photos**

![Photo 1](image5.png)
(Reference the article codes to Appendix 2)
Appendix 5-3 Photos about the charity lunch extracted from the *Herald*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VE01</th>
<th>VE02</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="VE01" alt="Image 1" /></td>
<td><img src="VE02" alt="Image 2" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VE03</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Reference the article codes to Appendix 3)
Appendix 5-4: Visual data about the charity lunch extracted from the SkyKiwi.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VC01 Photos</th>
<th>VC02 Photos</th>
<th>VC04 Screenshots</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image4.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image5.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image6.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image7.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image8.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image9.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VC03 Screenshots</th>
<th>VC05 Photos</th>
<th>VC05 Screenshots</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image10.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image11.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image12.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image13.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image14.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image15.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Reference the article codes to Appendix 4)
Appendix 6: Information for Participants

Information for participants

“The role of Chinese ethnic media in response to mainstream media’s portrayals of Chinese diaspora in New Zealand”

Synopsis of project

The aim of this proposed research is to explore the role of Chinese ethnic media in response to the portrayals of Chinese people in mainstream media of New Zealand by comparing the differences and similarities of the news reports between Chinese ethnic media and New Zealand mainstream media based on two particular cases: 1) Len Brown and his Asian lover – Bevan Chuang affair in 2013; 2) Chinese visitors dining at the charity Christmas lunch in 2012.

The researcher will collect your perspectives on the producing news reports in relation to these two particular cases.

If you agree to participate, you will be asked to sign a consent form. This does not stop you from changing your mind if you wish to withdraw from the project. Your parent/guardian can also ask for you to be withdrawn. However, because of our schedule, any withdrawals must be done within 2 weeks after we have interviewed you.

Your name and information that may identify you will be kept completely confidential. All information collected from you will be stored on a password protected file and only you, the researcher and my supervisors will have access to this information.

Please contact us if you need more information about the project. At any time if you have any concerns about the research project you can contact our supervisor:

My supervisor is Dr. Elena Kolesova, phone 815 4321 ext 8827 or email ekolesova@unitec.ac.nz

UREC REGISTRATION NUMBER: ..................................................
This study has been approved by the UNITEC Research Ethics Committee from ...... to ...... If you have any complaints or reservations about the ethical conduct of this research, you may contact the Committee through the UREC Secretary (ph: 09 815 4321 ext 5162). Any issues you raise will be treated in confidence and investigated fully, and you will be informed of the outcome.
Appendix 7: Participant Information Form

Participant Information Form

My name is Yu Yao (Olivia), I am currently enrolled in the Master of International Communication degree in the Department of Communication Studies at Unitec New Zealand and seek your help in meeting the requirements of research for a Thesis course which forms a substantial part of this degree.

The aim of my project is to explore the role of Chinese ethnic media in response to the mainstream media’s portrayals of Chinese diaspora in New Zealand.

I request your participation in the following way: participating in the interview. This interview will be audio recorded for the purpose of the research, including the master thesis and journal publishing in English and Chinese.

You will be identified in the Thesis. The results of the research activity will not be seen by any other person in your organisation without the prior agreement of everyone involved. You are free to ask me not to use any of the information you have given, and you can, if you wish, ask to see the Thesis before it is submitted for examination.

I hope that you will agree to take part and that you will find your involvement interesting. If you have any queries about the research, you may contact my principal supervisor at Unitec New Zealand.

My supervisor is Dr. Elena Kolesova, phone 815 4321 ext. 8827 or email ekolesova@unitec.ac.nz

UREC REGISTRATION NUMBER: ..............................
This study has been approved by the UNITEC Research Ethics Committee from .... to .... If you have any complaints or reservations about the ethical conduct of this research, you may contact the Committee through the UREC Secretary (ph: 99 815-4321 ext 8152). Any issues you raise will be treated in confidence and investigated fully, and you will be informed of the outcome.
Appendix 8: Participant Consent Form

Participant Consent Form

Research Project Title:

“The role of Chinese ethnic media in response to mainstream media’s portrayals of Chinese diaspora in New Zealand”

I have had the research project explained to me and I have read and understand the information sheet given to me.

I understand that I don’t have to be part of this research project should I chose not to participate and may withdraw at any time prior to the completion of the research project.

I understand that everything I say is confidential and none of the information I give will identify me and that the only persons who will know what I have said will be the researchers and their supervisor. I also understand that all the information that I give will be stored securely on a computer at Unitec for a period of 10 years.

I understand that my discussion with the researcher will be taped and transcribed.

I understand that I can see the finished research document.

I have had time to consider everything and I give my consent to be a part of this project.

Participant Name: .................................................................

Participant Signature: .............................. Date: ......................

Project Researcher: ..................................... Date: ......................

UREC REGISTRATION NUMBER: ..............................................

This study has been approved by the UNITEC Research Ethics Committee from ....... to ....... If you have any complaints or reservations about the ethical conduct of this research, you may contact the Committee through the UREC Secretary (ph: 09 815-4321 ext 6162). Any issues you raise will be treated in confidence and investigated fully, and you will be informed of the outcome.
Appendix 9: Interview questions for individual semi-structured interviews (Case 1)

(Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair in 2013)

The researcher will ask some warm-up questions in order to produce a relaxed and comfortable environment prior to the formal interview.

This may be recorded if the interview subject gives their permission. Otherwise written notes will be taken.

The researcher will introduce herself and thank the interviewee for their participation.

The researcher will then ask the interviewee to introduce himself/herself such as names, the length of to be journalist, permanent residents/citizens/work visa, the length of having been in New Zealand, self-identity, etc.

- The choice of quotes from the mainstream media

**Indicated example:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oct 17 2013</td>
<td>NZ Herald</td>
<td>“Luigi Wewege persuaded and even forced Chuang expose her relationships with Len Brown”;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan 07 2014</td>
<td>NZ Herald and 3News</td>
<td>“Chuang wants to contribute to ethnic community in New Zealand”;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mar 24 2014</td>
<td>NZ Herald</td>
<td>“although Chuang is experienced, her application of old job in Advisory Panel was denied”.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q1: Could you please tell me how did you choose these quotes? What did you mean when you quoted these contents?

Q2: In the process of choosing quotes from the mainstream media, what kinds of contents being maintained or abandoned or deleted? Why?

Q3: Were these choices following New Zealand or Chinese framework of news collection? Were they following Chinese ethical guidelines or any cultural reasons such as “face protection” of Chinese communities/people?

Q4: Could you suggest another examples please?

- The choice of news pictures

**Indicated example:**

In the first half reports, the news pictures of Chuang generally look like sad, helpless and without make-up; and Chuang’s clothes were dark colour.

In the last stages, Chuang’s news pictures were more likely to be radiant with joy and confidence and her dresses is turned to be bright colour.
Q1: Is there any special meaning of these choices of news pictures? What did you want to say?
Q2: What criteria do you use for choosing news pictures?
Q3: Could you give me another example please?

**The choice of News in the Relevant News Items**

**Indicated example:**

- Jan 07 2014, the news that: Chuang considers herself to be a politician, says Brown is her role model

The Relevant News Items listed with this news showed that:

1) “A woman feeling guilty wants to stop her extra-marriage relationship, the men publishing her naked photos is sued”
2) “An American woman runs a website for revenge lovers and gets more than 1,000 photos of other lovers”

Q1: How did you choose these relevant news? Were there any key words contributing to choose these news? If so, what were kind of key words used? Why? As the example showed that the items of relevant news included extra-marital affair and lover, but the title only indicated that Chuang wants to be politician.
Q2: After the relevant news filtrated via key words, did you to do any reviews and re-choices? If so, did you delate or add some news? Were there any reasons and intentions when you come to choose/delate some news in the Relevant News Items?
Q2: What kind of public opinion you would like to shape through these relevant news items?

**The other questions**

Q1: What did you mean when you described Chuang as a little princess? Is there anyone else described her like this? Who? What were the differences if ‘princess’ was also used by some mainstream media?
Q2: Why did you report that Chuang was abandoned by her father? Is an attempt to explain her behaviour?
Q3: I found some news you put them into the item of Immigration News, and some of them you put them into the item of Comprehensive News, were there any special reasons for these classifications? Do you have any specific targeted audience? Who and why?
Q4: What do you think of the reporting of the incident by other people? Especially after reading your news reports?
Q5: Are there anything else you would like to share with me?
Appendix 10: Interview questions for individual semi-structured interviews (Case 2)

(Chinese visitors dining in the charity charismas lunch in 2012)

The researcher will ask some warm-up questions in order to produce a relaxed and comfortable environment prior to the formal interview.

This may be recorded if the interview subject gives their permission. Otherwise written notes will be taken.

The researcher will introduce herself and thank the interviewee for their participation.

The researcher will then ask the interviewee to introduce himself/herself such as names, the length of to be journalist, permanent residents/ citizens/ work visa, the length of having been in New Zealand, self-identity, etc.

The choice of quotes from the mainstream media and the Chinese ethnic media

Indicated example:

Dec 27 2012, quoted from the NZ Herald and TVNZ that “regarding Chinese tourists sneaking into the charity lunch, the leader of the City Mission responded that they did not notice the participation of any tour group”.

Dec 28 2012, quoted from the United Chinese Press that “Regarding Chinese tourists sitting in the charity lunch, ‘Hua’ people and some tourism professionals questioned some details in the mainstream media’s reports. The journalists spent one month to seek the truth of this incident by visiting some organizations and interview with some people.”

Q1: Could you please tell me how did you choose these quotes? What did you mean when you quoted these contents?
Q2: In the process of choosing quotes from the mainstream media and the other Chinese ethnic media, what kind of contents being maintained or abandoned or deleted? Why?
Q3: Were these choices following New Zealand or Chinese framework of news collection? Were they following Chinese ethical guidelines or any cultural reasons Such as “protect face” of Chinese communities/people?
Q4: Could you please suggest another examples please?

The choice of news pictures

Indicated example: Two news pictures on Dec 26, 2012 and Dec 28, 2012 respectively

Q1: I found a very interesting thing that when you did not mention the incident of “Chinese visitors” in the news, the picture with this news, you used the one which included several Chinese (Asian) seniors sitting around the table. But when you really reported this incident, the picture you used did not indicate any Chinese (Asian) people. Could you please tell is there
any special reasons for this situation?
Q2: What criteria do you sue for choosing news pictures?
Q3: Could you please give me another example please?

● The choice of News in the Relevant News Items

Indicated example

Dec 28, 2012 The news: Did the mainstream media make a mistake? The incident of the Chinese tour group sitting in the charity lunch may be a Roshomon.

The Relevant News Items listed with this news showed that “a Chinese senior is trying to stop grandson involving in a fight, but becomes a defendant because a New Zealander misunderstood she/he wants to be violent with the grandson”
(Showing the Screenshot while the interview)

Q1: How did you choose these relevant news? Were there any key words contributing to the process of choosing these news? If so, what were kinds of key words used? Why?
Q2: After the relevant news filtrated via key words, did you do any reviews and re-choices? If so, did you delate or add some news? What were they? Were there any reasons and intentions when you come to choose/delate some news in the Relevant News Items?
Q3: What kind of public opinion you would like to shape through these relevant news items?

● The other questions

Q1: What did you mean when you use ‘new face’ to describe vaguely Chinese visitors in the charity lunch? Why?
Q2: I found some news you put them into the item of Immigration News, and some of them you put them into the item of Comprehensive News, were there any special reasons for these categories? Do you have any specific targeted audience? Who and why?
Q4: What do you think of the reporting of the incident by other people? Especially after reading your news reports? Are there anything else you would like to share with me?
Appendix 11: Other interview questions

- In terms of Len Brown and Bevan Chuang affair, I noticed that on 17 Oct 2013, SkyKiwi reported that “Chuang said she was used” in term of the extra-marital affair exposure; and then on 18 Oct, you also reported in the NZ Herald that “brown’s ex-mistress: I feel used”.

So my question is:
1. Whether you quote information from the Chinese ethnic media when you report some news about the Chinese diaspora in New Zealand?
2. In the process of choosing quotes from the Chinese ethnic media, what kind of contents being maintained or abandoned or deleted? Why?
3. Were these choices following New Zealand or Chinese framework of news collection?
4. Could you please suggest another example, please?

- Regarding the case of Chinese tourists dinning in the Christmas charity lunch, on 5 January 2013, you reported “tourist: we were conned”, which discussed Mr Xi and how the tourists being conned by a tour conductor. But a very interesting thing I noticed is that although the content about Chinese tourists, the news picture is a distant view of the charity lunch venue and do not highlight Chinese (Asian) participators.

So my question is:
1. What did you mean when you use this news picture with the report? And why?
2. What criteria do you sue for choosing news pictures?
3. Could you give me another example, please?

- I read some comments and discussion online, I found that you seem to be the person who are widely disputed by the Chinese diaspora in New Zealand, so how do you define your role in both the Chinese communities and New Zealand local society?

- As an Asian journalist in the New Zealand mainstream media, what’s the biggest challenge for you? Cultural thing or?

- What kind of news value reacted by your reports mainly? Is it “huaren” 華人 or New Zealand?
Appendix 12: Ethics Approval Letter

Yu Yoo
7 George Lawrence Lane
Mount Roskill
Auckland, 1041

20.11.14

Dear Yu,

Your file number for this application: 2014-1088
Title: The role of Chinese ethnic media in response to mainstream media’s portrayals of Chinese diaspora in New Zealand.

Your application for ethics approval has been reviewed by the Unitec Research Ethics Committee (UREC) and has been approved for the following period:

Start date: 4.11.14
Finish date: 4.11.15

Please note that:

1. The above dates must be referred to on the information AND consent forms given to all participants.

2. You must inform UREC, in advance, of any ethically-relevant deviation in the project. This may require additional approval.

You may now commence your research according to the protocols approved by UREC.

We wish you every success with your project.

Yours sincerely,

[Signature]

Sara Donaghey
Acting Deputy Chair, UREC

cc: Elona Koiasova
    Cynthia Almeida